



**CLYDE, KINTYRE AND ISLANDS FERRY STAKEHOLDER GROUP
(Arran, Bute, Campbeltown, Cumbrae, Colonsay, Islay, Jura, Gigha and Cowal)**

Minute of meeting held at **1100 on 21st June 2022** with those able to attend in person at Council HQ, Kilmory, Lochgilphead or remotely via Microsoft TEAMS.

IN ATTENDANCE	<p>NORTH AYRSHIRE COUNCIL Cllr Timothy Billings Ms Claire Fitzsimmons</p> <p>ARGYLL AND BUTE COUNCIL Cllr John Armour (Chair) Cllr Dougie MacFadzean Cllr Liz McCabe Cllr Alan Reid Mr Scott Reid</p> <p>INVERCLYDE COUNCIL Cllr Martin McCluskey Cllr Sandra Reynolds</p> <p>TRANSPORT SCOTLAND Mr Laurence Kenney Mr Richard Hadfield Mr Paul Flynn Mr Brian Gordon Mr Paul Linhart-MacAskill Ms Jacqueline Trousdale</p> <p>CALEDONIAN MACBRAYNE LTD (CALMAC) Mr Finlay Macrae Mr Andrew MacNair</p> <p>CALEDONIAN MARITIME ASSETS LTD. (CMAL) Mr Kevin Hobbs Mr Brian Fulton</p> <p>FERRIES COMMUNITY BOARD Angus Campbell</p> <p>HITRANS Mr Neil MacRae Mr Ranald Robertson</p> <p>SPT Alan Comrie</p> <p>HAULAGE REPRESENTATIVE</p>
---------------	---

	<p>Mr Jim Martin</p> <p>SCOTTISH CITYLINK Mr Ker Corbett</p> <p>BUTE FERRY COMMITTEE Jean Moffat</p> <p>ISLAY COMMUNITY COUNCIL Islay McEachern</p> <p>ISLAY FERRY COMMITTEE Jim Porteous</p> <p>ARRAN FERRY COMMITTEE Bill Calderwood</p> <p>NFU Lauren Worrell</p> <p>HIE Lucinda Grey</p> <p>WESTERN FERRIES Gordon Ross</p>
APOLOGIES	<p>Cllr Robin Currie, Argyll and Bute Council Jane MacLeod, Business Representative Angus Campbell, Ferries Community Board Christine Murdoch, Kilchreggan Community Council Gordon Smith, VisitScotland</p>

1	Appointment of Chair and Vice Chair	<p>Neil Macrae, Partnership Manager, HITRANS initially chaired the Meeting and referred to the circulated Terms of Reference document for the appointment of Chair and Vice Chair of the Ferry Stakeholder Group. In accordance with the Terms of Reference these appointments were required to be elected Councillors of the Local Authority.</p> <p>It was agreed to appoint John Armour as Chair (nominated by Cllr Liz McCabe and seconded by Jim Martin) and Timothy Billings as Vice Chair (nominated by Bill Calderwood and seconded by Ranald Robertson) of the Clyde, Kintyre and Islands Ferry Stakeholders Group.</p>
2	Minute of meeting held on 6th December 2021	The Minute of Meeting of 6th December 2021 was approved .
3	Matters Arising – Action Tracker	Finlay MacRae, Cal Mac updated members on the outstanding actions contained within the Action Tracker log including updating members on progress being made with the introduction of the new e-booking system. Other actions including that relating to the Fair Fares Appraisal would be addressed with later items in the agenda.
4	Caledonian MacBrayne Operational and Performance	Finlay MacRae introduced the operational and performance report contained within the meeting papers and which addressed the following:

	<p>Presentation covering (CFL)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Marketing • Contract Commitments • Timetable Integration and Consultation Update • Socio-Economic Report • Terms and Conditions Consultation (See Item 5 on the agenda) • Ar Turas Update (See item 6 on the agenda) • Route updates on the following: Claonaig/Tarbert to Lochranza Tarbert to Portavadie Colintraive to Rhubodach Ardrossan – Brodick Weymss Bay – Rothesay Largs – Cumbrae Ardrossan – Campbeltown (Summer Service) Kennacraig to Islay/Colonsay Tayinloan to Gigha Ardrossan – Campbeltown Gourock – Dunoon Gourock – Kilcreggan <p>The update on the marketing and commercial side of business focused on the repositioning the CalMac brand and the delivery of the new brand guidelines. The roll out would be managed in stages across all communications and include vessel, signage and uniforms. MV Loch Frisa being the first vessel to bear the new CalMac lettering font on her hull. Work continued with Digital Scotland on the digital refresh project and new campaigns targeting international customers from German speaking audiences and Travel Trade customers.</p> <p>The Report highlighted further focus on the customer experience with the roll out in the next six months of a new a new platform to measure performance which would identify areas of improvement to increase customer satisfaction. Also work in partnership with an external research agency to measure and track customer experience with commercial customers. Further analysis continued of bookings and ticketing data to gain insight on changes in purchase and use of ferry services since the pandemic.</p> <p>In reference to the Clyde and Hebrides Ferry Services (CHFS) the Report stated that CFL were currently at 97.0% complete or on track with the contract commitments. These include ongoing commitments with revised delivery dates e.g. the ticketing and reservation system now scheduled for October 2022.</p> <p>The Report confirmed that CalMac aimed to publish the Winter 2022/23 timetable by the end of July. The Summer 2023 consultation would also commence then with a view to publishing the timetable by year end.</p> <p>The Report further detailed the Socio-Economic assessment of CalMac’s services commissioned by CFL postponed due to the pandemic. As the results would not be representative of ‘normal’ times, the consultants Cebr had been asked to consider options</p>
--	---	--

		<p>for delivering the study with an initial phase by the end of 2021 and delivery of the final project report in summer 2022.</p> <p>Further updates were also provided on the CalMac Community Fund, Sponsorship Programme and Youth and Philanthropy Initiative.</p> <p>Cllr Alan Reid noted that half of sailings on Gourock-Dunoon service had been cancelled and that presumably it was operating as one vessel for period? He requested that this should be amended within the statistics provided.</p> <p>Action – Cal Mac to amend performance statistics making reference to point raised by Cllr Reid</p>								
5	Terms and Conditions Consultation	<p>An update was provided of the impending consultation of changes to CalMac’s current Terms and Conditions in regard to booking changes, cancellation and no-shows. CalMac proposed that these changes would address a significant problem of unused deck space, currently denying other customers the opportunity to travel. It was stated that these proposals had been developed in proportionate and comparable to the policies of other UK ferry operators. The consultation would be undertaken across the eight appointed Ferry Committees/Transport Forums and once concluded a more detailed overview of the proposals would be provided to the Ferry Stakeholder Group.</p> <p>Finlay Macrae stated that there was a three level consultation process and the feedback which had been received was being considered. He provided a general overview stating that the main driver was that there were currently no firm rules around CalMac’s ability to control the way the car deck spaces is booked, utilised and any changes made at the last minute. This was applicable to both general and commercial customers and referenced that utilisation of car deck space was one of the Commitments under the CHFS2 contract. The consultation on Terms and Conditions was being undertaken in layers and currently in a discussion and information gathering phase.</p> <p><u>Options Levy</u></p> <table border="0"> <tr> <td>29 Days or more before travel</td> <td>25% of the total vehicle fare</td> </tr> <tr> <td>8 to 28 days before travel</td> <td>50% of the total vehicle fare</td> </tr> <tr> <td>24 hours and 7 days before travel</td> <td>75% of the total vehicle fare</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Less than 24 hours or no show</td> <td>100% of the total vehicle fare</td> </tr> </table> <p>Bill Calderwood rejected the scale and inequality approach. Finlay MacRae said that he anticipated an interim statement and would make sure this would happen.</p>	29 Days or more before travel	25% of the total vehicle fare	8 to 28 days before travel	50% of the total vehicle fare	24 hours and 7 days before travel	75% of the total vehicle fare	Less than 24 hours or no show	100% of the total vehicle fare
29 Days or more before travel	25% of the total vehicle fare									
8 to 28 days before travel	50% of the total vehicle fare									
24 hours and 7 days before travel	75% of the total vehicle fare									
Less than 24 hours or no show	100% of the total vehicle fare									
6	Ar Turas (Presentation)	<p>A presentation submitted by Marc Stevenson. Customer Experience Lead, provided an update on the Ar Turas programme which aimed to deliver a modern booking, ticketing and travel experience for customers and staff by using market led software to standardise and simplify the process and help make buying CalMac travel easy and efficient. The update on the last quarter highlighted the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Challenges with delivering in March - Covid-19 had prevented the team training >700 colleagues face-to-face. • System Stability and Readiness- The wider E-Dea team was now onsite and in the network discussing the change; 1:1 testing and familiarisation with customers was continuing; 								

		<p>and there was focus on ensuring the system and setup was stable and ironing out any issues. Many of the team were out in the network demonstrating eBooking in preparation for formal training.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Communications and Engagement - Full re-plan was now in place, including Community Events, Digital Comms (social media, blogs, videos), Traditional Comms (posters, leaflets). The team continued to engage with various Ferry Committees, User Groups, Community Councils and other Partners. Insights had been gathered through various digital and traditional research and it was indicated that 4,502 responses had been received to date. <p>An action plan detailing key dates and actions from May to November 2022 was provided and it was highlighted that the following themes would be taken forward between now and October:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Communication and Engagement • Customer and Booking Migration • Training and Adoption • Cutover and testing <p>Members raised a number of points in response to the information provided: Jim Martin enquired about the anticipated savings of support staff and whether there would still be an option to go to the port if that was the preference for booking.</p> <p>Bill Calderwood asked if there was flexibility for purchasing of concession fares online. The need for a requirement to validate tickets was highlighted. There was also a discussion relating to the management of local concessions. It was agreed that a catch up between partners was required. Alan Comrie advised that SPT cannot financially support under 22s concession.</p> <p>The point was raised that it would be helpful to know where you were on the list for Standby traffic and whether Ar Turas would be able to help restore the waiting list numbered system that previously operated?</p> <p>Finlay MacRae agreed to follow up on the points raised in relation to Ar Turas and Alan Comrie in relation to local concessionary fares.</p>
7	Western Ferries Update Gourock - Dunoon	Gordon Ross provided an update for Western Ferries highlighting a 99.2% technical reliability for the previous year stating that he could circulate a more detailed performance review if the request was made for future meetings.
8	Fair Fares Appraisal	Neil MacRae, HITRANS submitted a Report on a Fair Fares Review Scoping Study commissioned by HITRANS. The Report stated that the Scottish Governments Programme for Government 2021/22 outlined a commitment to commission a Fair Fares Review to ensure a sustainable and integrated approach to transport fares. and HITRANS had committed to undertaking early work that would consider a number of issues relating to fair fares in the context of the Highlands and Islands.

		<p>Following the commissioning of transport consultants Stantec to assist with the review, the report provided a brief analysis of how bus use varied by location, a review of the existing framework in relation to concessionary travel and details of existing concessionary scheme. It also provided considerations for the forthcoming national fares review and the impacts of extending concessionary travel i.e. the benefits and costs of free ferry/rail travel, the financial impacts on islands residents an a very high level estimate of the cost to government of providing free ferry travel to under 22s. The report estimated the cost to extend free travel to ferry services for under 22's would be c£3.7m per annum. This had been developed on conservative assumptions and therefore the true cost could be lower.</p> <p>Angus Campbell highlighted that the Communities Board was very much behind this work having undertaken extensive work in this area themselves and stressed the need for island proofing when implementing such policies.</p>
9	<p>Transport Scotland Update – Island Connectivity Plan</p>	<p>Richard Hadfield spoke to the Islands Connectivity Plan Update presentation submitted by Transport Scotland. The presentation was based on the previous submission and provided the following:-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ICP Overview • Community Needs Assessments/Market Assessments • Long-term Plan and Investment Programme for Vessels/Ports • Fares Policy Review • Engagement and Consultation • Provisional Timings <p>Richard Hadfield referred to the ICP Provisional Programme for 2022/23 which involved bringing forward a suite of documents to full public consultation:</p> <p><u>2022</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Produce draft Ferries Plan implementation report for feedback ➤ End-2022 - full public consultation into Q1 2023 ➤ Draft vessels/ports investment plan ➤ Draft ICP – the overview strategy document ➤ Fares policy options ➤ Engagement Strategy ➤ Impact assessments & Financial Plan <p><u>2023</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Finalise documents following the consultation ➤ Community Needs Assessments ➤ Low Carbon Plan, Onward & Connecting Travel <p>Richard Hadfield indicated that work streams were not as advanced as anticipated and proposed to prioritise the Draft Vessels/Ports Investment Plan and the Draft ICP Overview Strategy Document to full public consultation by the end of the year. In anticipation of this, Transport Scotland would engage with all the organisations represented on the FSG on both these prior to going to the public in December 2022.</p> <p>Gordon Ross enquired where Transport Scotland were with the needs based assessment for Gourock-Dunoon. Richard Hadfield</p>

	<p>stated that the community needs assessment would be undertaken first.</p> <p>Bill Calderwood said that the current Ferries Plan was now redundant in his view and enquired as to when the Island Connectivity Plan would be completed.</p> <p>Jim Porteous highlighted that the absence of ferries withing the Sustainable Travel Hierarchy underpinning the National Transport Strategy and Strategic Transport Projects Review.</p> <p>Lauren Worrell, NFU highlighted the lack of new vessels and concern that the existing vessels would be able to maintain current connectivity until new tonnage was available.</p>
10	<p>CMAL Update</p> <p>Brian Fulton, CMAL submitted an update report. The Report indicated that projects remained on track as reported and Brian Fulton confirmed that ICIA's were being undertaken for each project.</p> <p>Following December's update, positive progress was reported on the following:</p> <p><u>Vessels</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the contract for 2 Islay vessels to the value of £45.5m each had contractual delivery dates of 15 November 2024 and 15 February 2025. • the Mallaig/Lochboisdale project had been formally initiated and a working group formed. The first public meeting had been recorded and was available on the CMAL website project page. • SVRP Phase 1 for 7 vessels in concept design phase with 2 variants for the routes for which they are intended (15 car capacity and 25 car capacity) - intention remained that they are all electric and work had commenced with SSEN in regard to grid capacity at all overnight berths. • SVRP Phase 2 will follow on from Phase 1 to address the replacement of the 'Sound Route' vessels (approx. 2027). <p>In reference to the Dual Fuel Vessels at Fergusons it was noted that a letter had been sent to NZET Committee on 23 March 2022 and Brian Fulton indicated there was more confidence in the delivery dates for MV Glen Sannox (March-May 2023) and H802 (October-December 2023). CMAL had also agreed to second a senior executive to Fergusons as Project Director and the CMAL site team were now assisting with resolution of the Owner's Observation Reports. This was welcomed by the Group.</p> <p>Brian Fulton recapped stating that the overall investment programme was for 22/23 vessels in total i.e. 10 small, 6 major, 3 passenger only and the 2 currently at Ferguson Marine. A total 10 year programme of £1.5 billion of which £580m had been committed for the first 5 years. He indicated that CMAL were keen to accelerate the programme and would have favoured an additional two vessels to the two Islay vessel contracts. However, competing priorities for the funding had made that unrealistic.</p> <p>In reference to the update on the Loch Frisa, Brian Fulton confirmed that the vessel came into service on the Craignure service on 6 June 2022. Out of a total of 600 vessels looked at over a number of years this was the first second hand tonnage to be brought into service. He further confirmed CMAL will continue</p>

		<p>to look at second hand tonnage and would be doing so over the next 2 weeks specifically to address short term resilience issues. Cllr McCluskey enquired about the status of the Gourrock Development. Brian Fulton said he was happy to share proposals and highlighted two key elements – replacement vessels on the route and the need to provide resilience for the Arran and Bute services.</p> <p>Gordon Ross enquired about plans for the MV Isle of Arran Cllr Billings stated he was pleased to hear faith in the delivery timetable for 801 and 802. The challenges facing Brodick Pier in easterly winds was raised with Brian Fulton confirming that a study to look at what might be done to improve its resilience was being procured.</p> <p>Jim Martin asked why new vessels were not made to fit existing ports. Brian Fulton stated that business cases included port upgrades along with other statement of requirements.</p> <p>Jean Moffat enquired as to who set the statement of requirements?</p> <p>Cllr Billings enquired why the cost of the new ferries appeared to be higher than those in other countries. In response Brian Fulton stated that the Islay vessels should fit the majority of new ports.</p>
11	<p>Other Infrastructure Updates</p>	<p>a)SPT Update Alan Comrie provided an update on behalf of SPT highlighting that concessionary fares were as per previous with supported buses on islands continuing to operate through the pandemic. He also highlighted the impact of inflation but that the proposed increase didn't go ahead because of the reduced demand through Covid however, this would need reviewed going forward. Bill Calderwood highlighted that ferries were equivalent of bus services for islands and the approach to concessionary fares should consider Islands Act. Alan Comrie highlighted that the concession on these services was a local authority funded scheme.</p> <p>b) Argyll and Bute Council Update Scott Reid provided an update on projects and services overseen by Argyll and Bute Council including those at Rothesay where they were working to come up with long term repair plan after initial repair, He also said that pontoons had arrived in the harbour this week and they were confident of them being in place in near future.</p> <p>He also highlighted ongoing work on Jura-Port Askaig service where they were continuing to work with the community to try and resolve the recruitment of a skipper.</p> <p>Further updates were provided on Dunoon – Kilcreggan service and planned roadshows.</p> <p>Jean Moffat highlighted that previous repair at Rothesay had not lasted 24hrs and that walking to the terminal was not pleasant. Scott Reid responded stating that they had supplied transport and wheelchair access on request and that work to repair lifts was a priority.</p> <p>Cllr MacFadzean said it was positive that the growing community on Jura had now been consulted but that she was keen to get timescales on when passenger access to the ferry via a rusty ladder would be replaced. Scott Reid stated the expectation was that this would be installed last week but had experienced delays. A levelling up bid for a replacement vessel was being prepared.</p> <p>c) Transport Scotland update (Ardrossan/Troon)</p>

		<p>Paul Linhart MacAskill provided to members on progress. Bill Calderwood said the work was appreciated highlighting the vulnerability at Ardrossan and the need for a schedule. Cllr Billings sought an update on the timeline and clarity on whether Troon would become the main port of refuge? Paul Linhart MacAskill said that the work was out to tender but the current agreement at Troon was short term and would need to be renegotiated.</p> <p>Action - Transport Scotland to update FSG on timescales.</p>
12	<p>Community Board Update</p>	<p>Bill Calderwood introduced the update report for the Ferries Community Board. The Report stated that the Board continued to meet regularly and had met with Erik Ostgaard, the new Chairman of DML at its meeting on 25 February 2022. The most recent meeting had been held on 27 May and with contributions from regular attendees, Transport Scotland, CMAL and CalMac. The following updates were provided:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increased confidence on the delivery of the 801/802 based on information provided by Transport Scotland. Further reassurance had been sought on the budget and the importance of speeding up new tonnage. The Board had discussion around resilience and using relief vessels to do extra runs to free up daytime space and it was recognised that there was a budget to be found around extra crewing. • The Board had a presentation and discussion around the ICP and a working Group had been set up. The fares element was a concern and it was noted that a starting point should be the refreshment of community needs assessment. There should also be a chance to look again at connectivity and the Board continued to campaign for equality on under 22 travel between bus travel and ferry travel. • CMAL had given the Board a comprehensive update on new builds and infrastructure improvements. The Board had requested increasing the existing order for the two Islay vessels to four to deal with reliability issues. Reassurances had been given that the search for second hand tonnage was an ongoing priority. It was noted that the Loch Frisa had been added to the fleet and the work of the Small Vessel Replacement Plan was also noted. • The Board had met with the Minister for Transport, Jenny Gilruth 2 who had expressed a willingness to work with the Board and Island Communities. There had been discussion around accelerating the new tonnage and delivering a better more inventive resilience planning. Direct involvement in recent outage discussions and the recent visits to many of our islands had been welcomed and it was hoped that the Minister would join the September Board meeting. • Robbie Drummond had updated the Board on resilience issues and the Board had raised questions in relation to working hours restrictions, cost of additional crews and how to better utilise fleet in times of outage. Age and reliability of the fleet were core issues but the Board urged flexibility and testing of new ideas/ways of working.

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In regard to the proposed changes to CalMac Terms and Conditions, the Board were of the opinion that charging for no shows was the wrong approach at this time as many islanders were suffering socially and economically through failures in ferry services. It was felt that a more targeted and refined approach was necessary and it was hoped that the new ticketing system would help with deck space utilisation and persistent offenders. • Project Neptune was due and it was hoped to see a more formal place in the decision making process for island communities and clearer lines or responsibility. • The Socio Economic Report was due to be published by the end of June and should inform ICP and the make case for a fit for purpose ferry system which would drive other policies, including the NET Zero agenda. The Board had contributed to NSet and taken part in discussions with the Cabinet Secretary with a follow on meeting planned in the future.
13	Confirm Pre-agreed Date of Next Meeting	It was agreed that the next meeting of the Clyde, Kintyre and Islands Ferry Stakeholder Group will take place on 8 th December (*It was subsequently agreed with members to reschedule this to 13:00 on the 13th January 2023.