

**ARGYLL FERRY STAKEHOLDER GROUP  
(Oban, Colonsay, Iona, Lismore, Coll, Tiree,  
Barra, South Uist, Islay, Kintyre, Jura, Gigha)**

There will be a meeting of this group at **Corran Halls, Oban, 14:00 on Monday 4<sup>th</sup> June 2018.**

**AGENDA**

**APOLOGIES AND INTRODUCTIONS**

<b>Present</b>	<b>ORGANISATION</b>
Ranald Robertson	HITRANS
Cllr Mary Jean-Devon	Argyll & Bute Council
Cllr Anne Horn	Argyll & Bute Council
Cllr Elaine Robertson	Argyll & Bute Council
Cllr John Armour	Argyll & Bute Council
Cllr Donald Manford	CnES
Cllr Iain MacNeil	CnES
Cllr Robin Currie	Argyll & Bute Council
Margaret Horn	Transport Scotland
Daniel Lafferty	Transport Scotland
Paul Flynn	Transport Scotland
Robbie Drummond	CalMac
Robert Morrison	CalMac
Demi Wylie	CalMac
David Cannon	CalMac
Ross Moran	CalMac
Dario	CalMac
Angus Campbell	CalMac Community Board
Russell	West Coast Motors / CPT
Cllr Roddy McCuish	HITRANS / Argyll & Bute Council
Bill Calderwood	Observer from Clyde FSG
Jim Porteous	Islay Community Council
Islay McEachern	Islay Community Council
Neal Goldsmith	Argyll & Isles Tourism Co-op
Kevin Hobbs	CMAL
Billy Neilson	Crofting Commission
Rob Trythall	Tiree Community Council
Des Bradley	ScotRail
David Hobhouse	Colonsay Ferry Committee / CC
Steven Neilson	Argyll and Bute Council
<b>Apologies</b>	
Brian Fulton	CalMac Ferries Limited
Iain Mackinnon	Comhairle nan Eilean Siar
David Smart	HIE
Martin Shields	Kerrera Ferry Committee

1	<p><b>Minute of Meeting held on 5 December 2017</b></p> <p>Minute approved as an accurate reflection of the meeting discussion.</p>
2	<p><b>Appointment of Chair / Vice Chair</b></p> <p>Cllr Mary Jean Devon was appointed as Chair.</p> <p>Cllr Roddy McCuish was appointed as Vice Chair.</p>
3	<p><b>Proposal to merge Clyde and Argyll Ferry Stakeholder Groups</b></p> <p>Jim Porteous presented a proposal to merge the Argyll and Clyde FSGs. In presenting this he suggested the merger could be tested on a trial basis for a one off meeting. Reasons for merging the groups given were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Commonalities in Membership</li> <li>- Commonalities in Agenda.</li> <li>- Route overlap.</li> <li>- Additional members could be as few as 8 to 10 additional elected members over the Argyll FSG Membership.</li> </ul> <p>Jim then invited Bill Calderwood of Arran Ferry Committee who had initiated the proposal at the Clyde FSG to add further comment and background to the proposal.</p> <p>Robin Currie expressed his preference for the status quo and retention of separate Groups covering Argyll and Clyde areas.</p> <p>Rob Trythall expressed his preference for the status quo.</p> <p>Donald Manford suggested that his first instinct was to remain as things stand but suggested there would be value in a full open meeting discussion to consider the issue.</p> <p>Iain MacNeil preferred the status quo and underlined the geographic challenge of the larger area particularly given the distance between Barra and South Uist and the Clyde area.</p> <p>Ann Horn indicated a strength in the increased area and therefore supported the proposal.</p> <p>Neal Goldsmith supported the proposal and suggested there is a commonality particularly for the south of the area. He suggested the meeting should be timetabled for a longer period than current practice of meetings scheduled to last 2 to 3 hours.</p> <p>John Armour supported the proposal and suggested Argyll and Bute Council representation could be reduced if the Groups were merged as there are currently four Councillors on the Clyde Group and four on the Argyll FSG.</p> <p><b>Action – it was agreed that Jim and Bill would prepare a document setting out the pros that support the merger and this can be added to with the potential cons in a paper to be included on the agenda of the next series of meetings to allow the request to be considered fully by the FSG and a conclusion reached on the matter. The paper would have no recommendation but could include key facts such as current Membership, attendance at recent meetings, numbers of individual representatives from single organisations that attend both meetings and apologies at these meetings.</b></p>

4	<p><b>Communities Board Update</b></p> <p>Angus Campbell, Chair of the Communities Board provided the FSG with an update on the work of the Communities Board.</p> <p>Angus advised that the Communities Board have worked through some of the frustrations that communities have felt as a result of the recent breakdown of MV Clansman and the network wide impact.</p> <p>The Communities Board seeks to add value to current structures including the DML Board and the Ferry Stakeholder Groups.</p> <p>The Communities Board has separately sought to take forward areas of common interest on vessel resilience and investment and on Communications.</p> <p>The Board seeks to see better Communications between CFL and the communities they serve.</p> <p>As Chair Angus meets with the main DML Board and provides a link with from the CB to that platform.</p> <p>The CB was established with 12 Members. The right was reserved to co-opt 2 members to ensure geographic coverage was adequately achieved. These will aim to get a member from each of Bute and the Uists.</p> <p>CB Members are appointed on a 18 month term.</p> <p>The CB will publish an annual report following completion of the Board's first calendar year.</p> <p>There followed a discussion on how messages from the Communities Board were being fed back to the Communities served.</p> <p>Other comments made included the need to develop the CB to ensure that it is representative of the entire network geographically and that it meets the needs of the communities served in every respect and that while the CB is a positive step it is not the change in direction that many communities would look for.</p>
5	<p><b>Marketing / Commercial Update</b></p> <p>Ross Moran provided an update on the success of the B2B scheme in managing block bookings more dynamically.</p> <p>Ross Moran provided an update on the introduction of print at home booking which has been tested on the Stornoway service.</p> <p>Following a discussion on the welcome improvement but ongoing slow progress in some areas there followed a discussion around the reservation and booking system and the need for real step change in the offer from Calmac to include smart ticketing, NFC or Mobile Phone ticketing recognising that print at home is far from revolutionary.</p> <p>Robbie Drummond advised that the Reservation System update has been identified as an option for consideration by Transport Scotland.</p> <p>The group collectively underlined their support for this item being approved urgently.</p> <p>Margaret Horn advised that this is being considered soon by Transport Scotland's finance group which could enable implementation within an 18 month horizon.</p> <p><b>Action – Margaret Horn would update on timescales for approval of the release of funds to support this contract commitment.</b></p>

6	<p><b>Ports / Harbours Update</b></p> <p>Kevin Hobbs reported on progress of the two new build ferries (MV Glen Sannox and 802).</p> <p>MV Glen Sannox is promised for delivery to CMAL at the end of the 2018/19 timetable but CMAL are concerned that this will not be achieved. From delivery CMAL anticipate an 8 week period before the ferry can enter service.</p> <p>Hull 802 is about 75% of steelwork complete. The expectation is that there will be a 12 month period from launch for delivery. This means the end of 2019 before 802 will be ready for service.</p> <p>801 and 802 not being delivered will have implications on the Argyll FSG service network in term so of the lack of their availability will have for other routes.</p> <p>There followed a discussion on the concerns felt across the Group about the lack of progress on delivering the vessels and concerns about the ability of FMEL to deliver the ferries.</p> <p>Robbie Drummond commented that they need to go on the basis of the information they have and all they can plan in the meantime is how the existing fleet is managed.</p> <p>Steven Neilson updated on the Craignure STAG meeting which is scheduled to take place next week. There followed a discussion on the need to get the message out clearly on the meetings to members of the public as it appears this information has not been shared generally within the Mull community.</p> <p><b>Action – Efforts will be made to ensure posters are displayed as key locations in Mull to overcome a lack of awareness in the local community that the STAG meeting is taking place.</b></p> <p>Steven Neilson reported that Argyll and Bute Council have consultants on site looking at improved berthing options for the Iona service.</p>
---	---

### Caledonian MacBrayne Operational and Performance Update

Ross Moran reported on the Operational performance and carrying statistics for the winter timetable period. The key facts being summarized in the table below:

#### Variance on Previous Period

Route Name	Passengers	Cars	Coaches	CVs
Ardrossan - Campbeltown				
Claonaig - Lochranza	-4%	-5%		-11%
Fionnphort - Iona	-3%	16%	0%	52%
Fishnish - Lochaline	7%	11%	27%	24%
Gallanach - Kerrera				
Kennacraig - Islay	3%	5%	53%	6%
Kennacraig - Islay/C'say/Oban	16%	12%		22%
Oban - Castlebay/Lochboisdale	10%	8%	-33%	12%
Oban - Coll/Tiree	-2%	-1%	-67%	1%
Oban - Colonsay	6%	10%	-50%	-5%
Oban - Craignure	-1%	4%	15%	0%
Oban - Lismore	1%	9%	-50%	33%
Tarbert LF - Portavadie	-4%	5%	-33%	9%
Tayinloan - Gigha	12%	22%	100%	28%
Tobermory - Kilchoan	0%	3%		43%

**Current Period: October 23, 2017 to March 29, 2018**

**Previous Period: October 23, 2016 to March 29, 2017**

Ross Moran confirmed that the trial of detailed route monthly reporting is ongoing but there is an opportunity to roll this out to further routes subject to discussion at the December 2018 FSG meetings.

8	<p><b>CHFS Contract Commitments</b></p> <p>RR submitted a Report which provided an overview of the commitments outlined by the successful operator (CalMac Ferries Ltd) within the contract for operating the Clyde and Hebrides Ferry Services. The Report stated that a £900m contract to operate ferry services on the west coast of Scotland was awarded to CalMac Ferries Ltd by Transport Scotland in May 2016 and came into force on 1 October 2016. The Report outlined the proposals the operator had identified to improve the service, help drive economic growth, improve customer service and deliver value for money. The Report highlighted the collated relevant summary tables for the majority of schedules within the Contract.</p> <p><b>Action - HITRANS would continue to engage with CalMac Ferries Ltd. and the Transport Scotland in relation to delivery of the commitments made within the contract for the Clyde and Hebrides Ferry Services with a view to building some reporting on these into future FSG meeting agendas.</b></p>
9	<p><b>Scottish Government Review of Ferry Procurement</b></p> <p>RR submitted a Report providing an update on the progress of the review undertaken into procurement processes and state aid requirements for the future funding of Scottish Government ferry services following publication of the Scottish Government Interim Report on the future approach to the procurement of ferry services.</p> <p>Rob Trythall made the point that there appear to be a disparity in the information published in the Interim Report and the Findings of the Audit Scotland report. The suggestion being that the tendering process has been demonstrated to have saved £20M over the lifetime of the CHFS contract and this is surely a strong case for tendering.</p> <p>The group discussed the report findings and the point around savings made through the recent CHFS tendering were agreed by CFL.</p> <p>Paul Flynn confirmed that no decision will be taken without extensive consultation.</p>

10	<p><b>Transport Scotland Update including VRDP and NTS</b></p> <p>Daniel Lafferty updated on progress towards completing the refresh of the National Transport Strategy. The update included:</p> <p>Margaret Horn updated that the OH STAG is ongoing and that public exhibitions took place in May.</p> <p>Margaret Horn updated on the evidence provided by Transport Scotland to the PAPL Committee at the Scottish Parliament and that some additional information is available on the PAPL webpages on the Scottish Parliament website.</p> <p><b>Action – Ranald agreed to circulate details of the link to the PAPL page on the Scottish Parliament website.</b></p> <p>Margaret Horn updated on the recent evidence taken by the REC Committee from the Minister earlier in May then again from Robbie Drummond and Calmac’s Chair on 30 May.</p> <p>Margaret Horn updated on VRDP progress:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- confirmed that Coruisk will remain in service to Mull pending delivery of 802.</li> <li>- New vessel and planning announced for Islay service.</li> </ul> <p>Jim Porteous sought an update on the provision of a new 90 metre vessel for Islay.</p> <p>Kevin Hobbs reported that this is at an early stage and is being worked on. The likely delivery timescale has the first milestone being to share design details with the communities by the end of 2018.</p> <p>Donald Manford asked for an update on the previous commitment for investment in the port of Castlebay.</p> <p>Kevin Hobbs reported that 2 pieces of work are being looked at. There is a requirement to undertake further work to understand the cost benefit of removing the constraint caused by the rock outcrop near the berth. Other works relating to bollards and fenders will need to progress regardless.</p> <p><b>Action – CMAL to share an update on current Harbour investment plans including Barra.</b></p> <p>Ranald Robertson suggested that the VRDP process is not comprehensive enough in that it needs to include Infrastructure investment needs within the plan so it fully recognizes vessel and infrastructure investment requirements.</p> <p>Members expressed a desire for the economic case for ferry services to be made cogently and clearly and that the evidence should be available publicly to support future investment choices.</p> <p>Rob Trythall requested that as the revised position with regard to delivery of 801 and 802 could a refreshed status be produced to enable communities to input to planning for Summer 2019. There is a crisis looming as a result of a significant part of the major vessel fleet becoming obsolete.</p> <p>Ranald Robertson suggested a good option might be to publish a draft of the 2017 VRDP</p> <p><b>Action – Transport Scotland will consider the suggestion of sharing a draft VRDP with the Ferry Stakeholder Groups to use them as a sounding board for the process as it unfolds.</b></p>
----	---

11	<p><b>Transport Integration Updates</b></p> <p>Demi Wylie provided an update on Transport Integration. Items noted included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- West Highland Line Review Team</li> <li>- CFL have been represented on the NTS Review with Demi covering the Greener and Healthier Thematic Group.</li> </ul> <p>Russell Dodds updated on the recent issues that West Cost Motors have had when there have been operational issues with the ferry services.</p> <p>Robert Morrison advised that the very recent issues were radar problems with the MV Isle of Mull and this was compounded by fog. Robert recognized the excellent work from West Coast Motors to take passengers via Lochaline and Lochailort to get them back to Oban working into the early hours of Sunday. The MV Isle of Mull has had a temporary fix and external contractors will be brought in to find a permanent repair.</p> <p>Iain MacNeil submitted the following statement on behalf of Uist and Barra Councillors:</p> <p><i>We are all now aware of the major concern on the resilience of the current fleet at the disposal of Calmac.</i></p> <p><i>The Interim MD of CalMac himself has decided to publicly focus attention on the aging fleet and need for urgent investment. Are we confident that anything will be done about it.....No.?</i></p> <p><i>We sit at numerous meetings where Calmac apologise and run out the same story about scouring the world looking for suitable vessels.</i></p> <p><i>In the meantime Island Communities suffer and there is clearly a loss of confidence which is having a major impact on our socio/economic wellbeing. This will clearly have a lasting impact and may take years to put right.</i></p> <p><i>In the Outer Hebrides our economy depends heavily on several outward looking sectors including tourism, aquaculture, seafood and agriculture. All of which are heavily reliant on ferries to ensure stability and a platform for growth. Capacity constraints and service disruption can have a serious impact on these sectors as has been seen network wide this Easter.</i></p> <p><i>CalMac Ferries Limited needs to move forward towards a commitment of a fair distribution of jobs to each of the islands served by their networks. We should all seek to work together on this objective.</i></p> <p><i>To help our economy grow sustainably we need the right operational and investment choices to be taken on our ferry services. That is best done in the communities that have ferry services rather than have these decisions taken in a place where the impact of bad decision making is not felt.</i></p> <p><i>Let's make sure that we never again have a re-run of this years fiasco.</i></p>
12	<p><b>Timetables Overview</b></p> <p>Demi shared the Timetable Requests overview as a hard copy.</p> <p><b>Action – HITRANS to circulate the presentation slides Demi has prepared with the wider membership.</b></p>
13	<p><b>Unresolved Issues from Ferry Committee for Resolution</b></p> <p>No items have been raised for resolution by the Ferry Stakeholder Group.</p>
14	<p><b>Next Steps, Timescales, Actions</b></p> <p>Ranald Robertson summarised the Actions from the meeting.</p>



15	<b>Confirm Pre-agreed Date of Next Meeting</b> The next meeting will take place on Monday 3 <sup>rd</sup> December 2018 in Oban.
----	---