

**CLYDE FERRY STAKEHOLDER GROUP  
(Arran, Bute, Cumbrae, Cowal, Kintyre)**

Minute of meeting held at the **Tontine Hotel, Greenock, at 11:00 on Friday 8<sup>th</sup> June 2018.**

**APOLOGIES AND INTRODUCTIONS**

**Present**

Cllr Len Scoullar (Chair)  
Cllr Timothy Billings  
Cllr John Armour  
Douglas Ellis  
Alan McCabe  
Paul Flynn  
Robbie Drummond  
Ross Moran  
Demi Wyllie  
David Cannon  
Angus Campbell  
Bill Calderwood  
Steven Neilson  
Ker Corbett  
Allan Comrie  
Ranald Robertson

**Organisation**

Argyll & Bute Council  
North Ayrshire Council  
ABC / Campbeltown FC  
Transport Scotland  
Transport Scotland  
Transport Scotland  
CalMac  
CalMac  
CalMac  
CalMac  
CalMac Communities Board  
Arran Ferry Committee  
Argyll & Bute Council  
Citylink/CPT  
SPT  
HITRANS

**Apologies**

Cllr Ellen McMaster  
Cllr Alan Reid  
Des Bradley  
Bill Steel  
Cllr Ronnie Ahlfeld  
Cllr Roddy McCuish  
Cllr Chris McEleny  
Daniel Lafferty  
Alistair Dobson  
Gordon Smith

North Ayrshire Council  
Argyll & Bute Council  
ScotRail  
Cumbrae Ferry Committee  
Inverclyde Council  
HITRANS / Argyll and Bute Council  
Inverclyde Council  
Transport Scotland  
Visit Arran  
VisitScotland

1	<p><b>Minute of Meeting on 1 February 2018</b></p> <p>RR confirmed HITRANS actions had been discharged as per the Actions.</p> <p>Cllr Scoullar thanks Transport Scotland for their positive action in agreeing the revised Weymss Bay – Rothesay timetable.</p>
---	--

2	<p><b>Appointment of Chair / Vice Chair</b></p> <p>Cllr Len Scoullar appointed as Chair.</p> <p>Cllr Timothy Billings appointed as Vice Chair.</p>
3	<p><b>Proposal to merge Argyll and Clyde Ferry Stakeholder Groups</b></p> <p>Bill Calderwood introduced the item setting out the reasoning behind his proposal to merge the Argyll and Clyde groups.</p> <p>Combine the two meetings to reduce time commitments for a number of attendees. Increase use of tele / video conferencing.</p> <p>Increase frequency of the meetings to 3 per annum.</p> <p>Greater emphasis on development.</p> <p><b>Action - The Clyde Group agreed to the proposed merger and increase in meeting frequency to 3 meetings. This will be ratified subject to the same agreement being reached at the December cycle of meetings where the Argyll group will reach a final position on the proposal.</b></p>
4	<p><b>Marketing / Commercial Update</b></p> <p>Ross Moran provided an update on the success of the B2B scheme in managing block bookings more dynamically.</p> <p>Ross Moran provided an update on the introduction of print at home booking which has been tested on the Stornoway service and is being extended to more routes.</p>
5	<p><b>Ports/Harbours Update</b></p> <p>Kevin Hobbs reported:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- that Brodick Passenger Terminal has now been opened at a cost of £30M</li> <li>- Lochranza facilities are being renewed and toilets opened.</li> <li>- Portavadie facilities are being renewed.</li> <li>- Colintrave to Rhubodach slipway renewal project is delayed but has had no impact on the route.</li> <li>- Claonaig renewal is being programmed.</li> <li>- Harbour works are fund limited and relies on SG capital allocations. In recent years CMAL have received support from SG in line with what has been asked for by CMAL.</li> </ul> <p>There followed a discussion on the update that included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Timothy Billings highlighted that if comments on Brodick Terminal have been made by users and stakeholders these should be looked at to understand if there are lessons to be learned elsewhere as users do believe the Terminal could have been set out differently to the benefit of the user.</li> <li>- Kevin confirmed that a master list of comments has been collated and will be considered for future investment.</li> </ul> <p>Steven Neilston reported that works will be undertaken in Rothesay that will see some sailings cancelled for the duration of the works. Argyll and Bute Council are nearing completion of the approvals process.</p> <p>Kevin Hobbs updated on the current state of play with MV Glen Sannox. A working group has been established to look at the continued lateness of the programme. The information from FMEL is that delivery will be to CMAL by the end of the winter 2018/19 timetable. This is the official line but CMAL are sceptical that this will be achieved. CMAL are in regular correspondence seeking a clear update from the yard. CMAL share the concern that MV Glen Sannox will not be in service in Summer 2019.</p> <p>Kevin confirmed that whatever happens the ships will be completed by the yard.</p>

6

**Caledonian MacBrayne Operational and Performance Update**

Ross Moran confirmed that a delay had caused stats not to be shared in advance and that these would now have to follow for circulation by the Secretariat.

**Variance on Previous Period**

Route Name	Passengers	Cars	Coaches	CVs
Ardrossan - Brodick	-2%	1%	-15%	-2%
Claonaig - Lochranza	-4%	-5%		-11%
Colintraive - Rhubodach	-3%	-7%	-10%	11%
Gourock - Dunoon	-6%			
Largs - Cumbrae Slip	-2%	0%	10%	6%
Tarbert LF - Portavadie	-4%	5%	-33%	9%
Wemyss Bay - Rothesay	-1%	2%	-10%	-3%

**Current Period: October  
23, 2017 to March 29,  
2018**

**Previous Period: October  
23, 2016 to March 29,  
2017**

Ross confirmed the intention to extend the performance pack reporting.

The group discussed the reporting and a number of points were made about the value of the information as reported which while the group understood the link to contract monitoring comments were made that it would be useful to see information reported on the basis of actual performance against published timetables not after relief events so a clearer picture would be provided on impacts including weather, technical faults etc.

**Action – It was agreed that the Performance Reporting Pack format will be finalized by the end of June 2018.**

**Action – Transport Scotland and CFL to consider the points made around performance reporting against timetable and come back to the Group to report on whether there is a way of ensuring the information reported is as meaningful as possible rather than wedded to contractual performance measures.**

7	<p><b>CHFS Contract Commitments</b></p> <p>Ranald Robertson submitted a Report which provided an overview of the commitments outlined by the successful operator (CalMac Ferries Ltd) within the contract for operating the Clyde and Hebrides Ferry Services. The Report stated that a £900m contract to operate ferry services on the west coast of Scotland was awarded to CalMac Ferries Ltd by Transport Scotland in May 2016 and came into force on 1 October 2016. The Report outlined the proposals the operator had identified to improve the service, help drive economic growth, improve customer service and deliver value for money. The Report highlighted the collated relevant summary tables for the majority of schedules within the Contract.</p> <p><b>Action - HITRANS would continue to engage with CalMac Ferries Ltd. and the Transport Scotland in relation to delivery of the commitments made within the contract for the Clyde and Hebrides Ferry Services with a view to building some reporting on these into future FSG meeting agendas.</b></p>
8	<p><b>CHFS Demand Management</b></p> <p>Ranald Robertson introduced the item linking to the contract commitment for a new reservation, booking and ticketing system.</p> <p>Robbie Drummond set out the failings of the current system and the recent challenges it has caused in the recent period of significant disruption. A more modern system would have automated the process of rebooking passengers and alerting them to changes in the system. CFL have identified an option for a new system as a solution that has been included in the bid. The replacement process will take 18 Months but as this is a Contract Asset it needs to be funded by TS and this has meant the bid commitment cannot be met.</p> <p>Alan McCabe confirmed that the decision on a new system is sitting with the Transport Scotland Investment Board.</p>
9	<p><b>Scottish Government Review of Ferry Procurement</b></p> <p>Ranald Robertson submitted a Report providing an update on the progress of the review undertaken into procurement processes and state aid requirements for the future funding of Scottish Government ferry services following publication of the Scottish Government Interim Report on the future approach to the procurement of ferry services.</p> <p>The Group noted the report.</p>
10	<p><b>Transport Scotland Update including VRDP</b></p> <p>Bob Davie provided the VRDP update touching on the following key points:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- A new 90m vessel recommended for Islay and subsequently announced by the Minister.</li> <li>- Mallaig to Armadale identified as a pressure point on the network that will need to be looked at.</li> <li>- Outer Hebrides STAG update on the process and what PBA have undertaken in terms of engagement.</li> </ul>
11	<p><b>Transport Integration Updates</b></p> <p>Demi Wyllie provided an update on the work CFL have taken forward on improving timetable planning together with ScotRail.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 70% of Glasgow to Rothesay journeys allow a 30-minute connection time at Weymss Bay.</li> <li>- For other connection issues Demi is happy to be first point of contact for communities on the CHFS network and will seek to follow up any improvement opportunities.</li> </ul>

12	<p><b>Timetables Overview</b></p> <p>Demi Wyllie circulated an overview of the Summer 2019 Community Timetable Requests for the Clyde Ferry Stakeholder Group network.</p> <p>There followed a group discussion on the request process.</p>
13	<p><b>Communities Board Update from the Chair</b></p> <p>Angus Campbell provided an update in his capacity as Chair of the Community Board.</p> <p>Angus advised that the Communities Board have worked through some of the frustrations that communities have felt as a result of the recent breakdown of MV Clansman and the network wide impact.</p> <p>The Communities Board seeks to add value to current structures including the DML Board and the Ferry Stakeholder Groups.</p> <p>The Communities Board has separately sought to take forward areas of common interest on vessel resilience and investment and on Communications.</p> <p>The Board seeks to see better Communications between CFL and the communities they serve.</p> <p>As Chair Angus meets with the main DML Board and provides a link with from the CB to that platform.</p> <p>The CB was established with 12 Members. The right was reserved to co-opt 2 members to ensure geographic coverage was adequately achieved. These will aim to get a member from each of Bute and the Uists.</p> <p>CB Members are appointed on an 18-month term.</p> <p>The CB will publish an annual report following completion of the Board's first calendar year.</p> <p>There followed a discussion on how messages from the Communities Board were being fed back to the Communities served.</p>
14	<p><b>Unresolved Issues from Ferry Committee for Resolution</b></p> <p>No issues were escalated from the Ferry Committee for consideration.</p>
15	<p><b>Next Steps, Timescales, Actions</b></p> <p>Ranald Robertson summarised the Actions taken at the meeting which members agreed were accurate.</p>
16	<p><b>Confirm Pre-agreed Date of Next Meeting</b></p> <p>Recognising the concern raised by Transport Scotland over trying to cover all four meetings in a single week it was agreed that meetings would be held in weeks commencing 3<sup>rd</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> December.</p> <p><b>Action: The date agreed for the next meeting was Wednesday 12<sup>th</sup> December with the preferred venue being SPT offices in Glasgow.</b></p>