

HEBRIDES FERRY STAKEHOLDER GROUP

(Barra, South and North Uist, Harris and Lewis)

Minute of Meeting held at the Croft Room, The Caladh Hotel, Stornoway on Thursday 13 December 2018 at 10.30pm.

IN ATTENDANCE	COMHAIRLE NAN EILAN SIAR
	Mr Uisdean Robertson (Chairman)
	Mr Kenny Macleod (Vice-Chairman)
	Mr Iain A. Macneil
	Mr Iain Macleod
	Mr Iain Mackinnon
	Mr John Mackay
	Mr David Smart
	Mr Kenny Morrison
	Miss Mairi Sine Macdonald
	HITRANS
	Ranald Robertson
	TRANSPORT SCOTLAND
	Mr Richard Hadfield
	Mr Sean Jamieson
	Mr Allan McCabe
	CALEDONIAN MACBRAYNE LTD. (CALMAC)
	Mr Robert Morrison
	Ms Demi Wylie
	Mr Finlay Macrae
	Mr Andrew McNair
	Mr Bill Main
	Mr David Gibson
	HIE
	Ms Joanna Peteranna
	OUTER HEBRIDES TOURISM (OHT) Mr Rob Mackinnon
	Mr Ian Fordham
	ROAD HAULIERS ASSOCIATION
	Mr D.R. MacLeod
	OUTER HEBRIDES COMMERCE GROUP
	Ms Gail Robertson
Apologies	Mr Kevin Hobbs (CMAL)
	Mr Kevin Peach (Ullapool Harbour Trust)
	Mr Paul Finnegan (CNES)
	Mr Donald Manford (CNES)
	Mr Ker Corbett (CPT)
	Mr Alex MacLeod (Stornoway Port Authority)
	Mr Douglas Ellis

1.	Minute	The Minute of Meeting of 8 June 2018 was approved , subject to the following amendment to the narrative at Item 6.
		"Mr Drummond stated CalMac has a timetable it cannot deliver. This needs to be looked at and the timetable changed".
		to be changed to
		"Mr Drummond stated CalMac has a timetable that required to be amended".
		Mr Robert Morrison, Head of Service Delivery Operations, CalMac stated that CalMac would not be redrafting the timetable as that would have crewing implications and that the above referred to 'turnaround' at ports which had improved over the last two years due to better management of check-ins and loading and unloading of vessels to which experienced loading officers was key. There would be further discussion of timetables at Item 4 on the Agenda.
2.	Matters Arising	In relation to Item 6, CHFS Contact Commitments it was noted that a new booking system was still under consideration and had been the subject of significant discussion at the Uist Summit on 9 November 2018. It was noted that a robust business case for a new system would be presented to Transport Scotland's IDM Board in January 2019.
3.	Caledonian MacBrayne Operational and Performance Update	The Chairman, on behalf of the Group congratulated Mr Robert Morrison on his recent appointment within the organisation to Head of Service Delivery Operations. Mr Morrison provided an overview of restructuring within the company and emphasised the positive benefits of increasing the area operations management. As a result Mr Finlay Macrae would provide a dedicated service to the Hebrides. Mr Morrison also highlighted the development of an Integrated Operations Control Centre (IOCC) anticipated to be operational in February 2019 to provide better management and control of disruption communications. Mr David Gibson, Service Delivery Director, CalMac gave assurances that the purpose of IOCC would be an over-arching management role and that CalMac recognised 'local' decision making and that they would continue to depend on local operational staff and ultimately the Masters of the vessels in regard to sailings. Mr Finlay Macrae, Area Operations Manager (North) provided an overview of the operational performance update in respect of the Hebrides group for the period 30 March to 21 October 2018. In addition, a monthly dashboard of carrying trends on the Ullapool/Stornoway route was provided showing comparative figures with 2017. The issues highlighted under discussion related to performance against contract not being reflected in the report e.g. not a true reflection of the Mallaig/Lochobisdate disruption in June 2018 which ran true to timetable but had to be repositioned via another route. Mr Morrison acknowledged this issue which had also been raised at an earlier meeting of the Clyde Stakeholders Group. Mr Iain Mackinnon, Director of Technical Services, CNES and Mr D.R. Macleod, representing Road Hauliers sought assurances in respect of the sea worthness of the MV Loch Seaforth subsequent to the incident 8 August 2018 and whether the MCA had imposed any restrictions. These questions were raised in light of public perception, CalMac staff reportedly stating that the vessel would not sail in swells over four metres a

		Action – Mr Robert Morrison would ensure:
		(1) future Operational and Performance Reports would contain an additional column showing performance against timetable;
		(2) future weather disruption communications would include details of swell height; and
		(3) ferry dashboard statistics for the previous 6 month period for each route are circulated to the Chairs of all Ferry Stakeholder Groups and that Ms Katy Cunningham, Office Manager, HITRANS is included in the circulation.
4.	Winter 2019/20 Timetable Overview	Ms Demi Wylie, Timetables and Transport Integration Manager, CalMac presented an overview of the Winter 2019/20 timetables. Ms Wylie stated that there had been one request for earlier morning and evening departures from Castlebay on a daily basis and that the timetable would be submitted to Transport Scotland on Friday with a view to being finalised next week.
		Mr Iain Mackinnon, Director of Technical Services, CNES highlighted future capital investment in Castlebay in the form of a care facility in Castlebay for construction in 2019/20 and redevelopment of Castlebay Community School which would place further demand on ferry links into Barra for contractors and materials over a two year period.
		It was noted that Mr Iain Mackinnon, in his new role as Head of Investment Delivery at the Comhairle would be initiating dialogue with all transport providers in the new year on the needs for access to and from Barra for delivery of the above projects.
		Cllr. Iain A. MacNeil, CNES raised a 'social' request for additional sailing on the Castlebay Summer Timetable which Transport Scotland did not support due to financial restraints as it would require additional crewing.
		Ms Gail Robertson, representing the Outer Hebrides Commerce Group suggested that the cost of additional crewing across the network should be weighed up against the costs to the economy of each of the islands. It was noted that this was included in cost benefit analysis work currently being undertaken.
		Mr Ian Fordham highlighted that there was no evaluation available on refusals to the Summer 2019 timetable amendments. Also refused requests should sit within the timetable request system and should not have to be resubmitted.
		Mr Richard Hadfield, Head of Sponsorship and Finance, Transport Scotland stated that this was his first involvement with timetabling and intimated that a different approach was required subsequent to the issues raised at the Uist Summit. In response to a query in regard to the £6m ferries budgets he stated that that there was an in-built overspend each year and any spare resources were reinvested. Mr Hadfield stated that decisions on changes were down to affordability and that the onus was on communities, including CalMac Community Board, HIE and the Comhairle to make a business case. It was noted that Transport Scotland would be meeting with CalMac on Tuesday 18 December 2018 to finalise the timetable.
		Action
		(1) Ms Demi Wyle would place a marker on the timetable in respect of the proposed works in Barra; and
		(2) Mr lain Mackinnon, would formally submit the timetable request on behalf of Cllr. lain A. MacNeil to Demi Wylie for submission to Transport Scotland.

5.	Regional VRDP Update	 Mr Bill Main, Forecasting and Planning Manager, CalMac introduced a presentation on the Vessel Replacement and Deployment Plan for two years 2017 and 2018 which updated the 2016 Annual Report analysis. Information was provided on: Actual carryings data used for period January 2017 to September 2018 Forecasts of future demand based on the 2016 analysis Review of vessel capacities undertaken Summer 2018 and Winter 2018/19 timetables used as baseline for future service frequency The figures in the two tables were based on a peak 9-week period from the last week in June to the last week in August. Peak time capacity utilisation (forcasted and actual) for 2017 and 2018 and the forecasted figures for 2018-2024 were detailed for each route which was based on vehicle deck figure and not foot passengers. The outcomes of the STAG will impact these figures. Under discussion it was highlighted that 70% or above demand was constrained. Therefore unconstrained demand was not identified so therefore not reflected in the forecasts. The Chairman put forward the questions. Question 1-3 for Calmac and question 4 to Transport Scotland: (1) There was clearly some presumption that MV Isle of Arran will be removed from regular service after 801 and 802 enter service. Why not absorb the increased capacity the MV Glen Sannox provides to Arran provide throuse service and how does that compare with the forecasts presented for Western Isles routes? (2) Why waste the Caledonian Isles on the tiny traffic volume travelling to Campbellown? If MV Caledonian Isles was deployed to Mull what would that do for traffic forecasts? (3) The increased fielet with short term life extension of admittedly elderly vessels could enable a redeployment of vessels to provide the clearly westenes and how does that compare with the platform to engage with and scrutinise the VRDP and the recommendations of the Network Strategy Group at an early stage so consensual d
6.	Outer Hebrides STAG Update	Richard Hadfield provided a verbal update on the Outer Hebrides STAG and stated that Peter Brett Associates (PBA) had undertaken a detailed appraisal of a
	орицо	shortlist of options. Subsequent to a further meeting next week it was anticipated that the Interim Final Report would be completed with a view to going out for further consultation with key stakeholders in early 2019 with view to completing the Detailed Options Report to timetable in February/March 2019.
		lain Mackinnon, Director of Technical Services, CNES and Ranald Robertson, HITRANS Partnership Director are members of the Project Reference Group which had oversight of the development and delivery of the Assessment. However, it was noted that HIE were not represented on the Group and Mr Mackinnon sought assurances that all stakeholders would be included in the next

		consultation round.
		Action – It was agreed that Richard Hadfield would issue a copy of an Executive Summary of the Interim Report for the next round of consultations into the public domain.
7.	Current Project/Programme Update	Mr Andrew McNair, Head of Marketing, CalMac provided a marketing update highlighting the key priorities in terms of the strategy i.e.
	Opuale	 Continued research Aligning marketing outputs e.g. digital, social media, outdoor, print etc. Build up assets Proactive in communicating the good stuff Roll-out the customer facing brand
		 Work collaboratively with our partners to achieve mutual objectives The key activities for the remainder of the year included:-
		 Big push mid-January/February to encourage forward booking for Summer 2019 Working direct with DMOs in joint partnerships to stimulate shoulder season
		 (2) Working direct with Division joint participant of standard should be season traffic (3) Audit of the website as a preamble to a significant overhaul in 2019 (4) Review of print and prioritise the presentation and format of timetables (5) Improving 'front of house' presentation on vessels and in key ports (6) Tactical campaign in run up to end of year focusing on summer timetable, retail offer, adventures and online shop
		Mr McNair stated that there had been a shift of responsibility and focus within the Marketing Team with a view to better understanding opportunities. The way forward included a bottom-up approach with more engagement locally, prioritising communication, more collaboration and information and data sharing. Mr McNair had committed to allocating two working days per month in Stornoway and across the islands and it was noted that he was currently working with Outer Hebrides Tourism on a robust marketing model and campaign, part of which included marketing press focussing specifically on the Uists.
		Further slides had been submitted providing an update on bids commitments to September 2018 as part of CFLs bid submission encompassing a wide range of activities over the lifetime of the contract. At the end of Contract Year 1, 82% of Bid Commitments (282) had been completed or on track to be completed by the original baseline dates. Of these, 109 were recurring and subject to review by Transport Scotland on a regular basis. The slide further detailed where the company currently was with progress on these commitments, and successes achieved to date. Updates would continue to be submitted to future Meetings of the Stakeholder Group.
		It was agreed to note the Current Project/Programme Update.
8.	Uig/Lochmaddy/Tarbert Infrastructure and Vessel Update	Richard Hadfield informed the Group that the allocation for Piers and Harbours within the Draft Budget 2019/20 was £48m which would cover all three projects and work was progressing towards procurement stage.
		Mr Hadfield provided a brief update on Lochboisdale, Mallaig/Armadale and Oban. In regard to the timetabling of works he stated that there would be minimal disruption at Lochmaddy and Tarbert. However Uig would be challenging given the outage of the linkspan for 6-7 weeks and Transport Scotland were currently awaiting the outcome of options from the Working Group. The final decision regarding the necessary timetable changes will be taken by Transport Scotland and the Group highlighted the importance that adequate notice of any alternative arrangements would be given for the proposed works. It was noted that the options for scheduling the works at Uig would either be during October/November 2019, Mid-April/May 2020 or October/November 2020 to be determined by The Highlands Council.
		Ms Joanne Peteranna brought the Group's attention the Lochboisdale STAG in the context of long term aspirations for the development of Lochboisdale Harbour and

		Gasay Island and that HIE, and local Comhairle Members should be included in any future engagement.
		Action – It was agreed that Richard Hadfield include HIE and Comhairle Members in future engagement on the Lochboisdale STAG.
9.	Ports/Harbours Update	There were no updates from Mr Kenny Morrison, Harbour Master, CNES in respect of Ports and Harbours.
10.	Communities Board Update	Ms Gail Robertson, as the only representative of the Community Board at the meeting was called upon to give an update. As a new Member to the Board Ms Robertson stated that the Board had only been in operation for a year and still finding its feet and that the first Annual Report was due shortly. Ms Robertson further highlighted recent engagement between the Chairman of the Board, Mr Angus Campbell and Ministers in relation to communication, vessel deployment and other strategic issues i.e. Pet Policies and, going forward, the Board wished to improve connections and engage more with Community Councils and Schools.
		It was agreed to note the update.
11.	Transportation Integration Updates	A paper had been submitted providing and update on Transport Integration and Ms Demi Wylie highlighted:
		• there were no changes to the CalMac summer 2019 timetable, therefore no impacts on transport connections;
		• the Transport Integration Strategy had been drafted and following further engagement with stakeholders it would be finalised in February 2019;
		no changes to Scotrail timetable;
		no major timetable changes to Citylink;
		 from December Citylink would deploy a larger vehicle on the Ullapool/Inverness service to reduce capacity issues but pre-booking was advised;
		• CNES four year budget strategy and service redesign would impact on transport; and
		 priorities for CNES buses included identifying bus to ferry connectivity at the Sounds of Harris and Barra slipways and new bus contracts would commence from August 2019.
		It was further noted that the long stop at Invergarry on the Uig/Inverness bus route had been amended and incorporated into the Winter Timetable.
		Action – Demi Wylie will circulate copies of the Transport Integration Strategy.
12.	Scottish Islands Passport	Mr Ranald Robertson, Partnership Director, HITRANS spoke to a Report submitted by Neil Macrae, Partnership Manager, HITRANS providing an update on progress made on the development of a Scottish Islands Passport as a marketing initiative which had the potential to develop sustainable tourism opportunities in remote islands and support lifeline ferry and air services. The Report stated that passport scheme had been included within the Scottish Government's Programme for Scotland 2018/19. HITRANS officers had agreed to provide a detailed project plan outlining the potential scope of the proposal, its intended market and how it might be delivered. HITRANS had also agreed to lead on submitting a cooperative application to the EU LEADER funding stream for the Passport proposal. The draft scoping document was detailed in the Appendix to the Report.
		It was agreed to note the update.
13.	Confirm Pre-agreed Date of Next Meeting	It was noted that the next Meeting of the Hebrides Ferry Stakeholder Group would be on Thursday 6 June 2019 in the Dark Island Hotel, Benbecula.