



HABTRANS CONSULTANCY LTD

REPORT – FEBRUARY 2008

Glasgow – Oban Service Enhancements

HABTRANS CONSULTANCY LTD

Glasgow – Oban Service Enhancements

© Habtrans Consultancy Ltd
1 Strathmiglo Place, Larbert FK5 4UQ
Telephone 07840 053154

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
CHAPTER 1	
Executive Summary	2
CHAPTER 2	
Background	3
CHAPTER 3	
Service Level Options	5
CHAPTER 4	
Conclusions	22

Introduction

Habtrans Consultancy Ltd has been commissioned by Highland Rail Partnership (HRP) to examine service options on the West Highland Lines between Glasgow Queen Street and Oban (with implications for services to Fort William and Mallaig) which could be introduced at the main timetable changeover date in December 2009. This will coincide with further service improvements on other routes, notably the final phase of introduction of high-speed services on the West Coast Main Line between Glasgow Central and London Euston.

An hourly service is planned between Glasgow and London from December 2009, with quicker journey times. It is felt that the present West Highland Timetable, designed to cater for faster diesel multiple units (Sprinters) since 1989, caters mainly for summer tourist traffic. Greater through travel opportunities at all times of the year will arise with improvements to other routes on the network. Government policy of making public transport much more attractive and to encourage more local and commuter traffic by rail has proved successful in other similar areas, notably around Inverness with the introduction of various phases of Invernet. This has seen an upturn of passenger usage in the Invernet area of around 30% and has encouraged ongoing improvements year on year since 2005.

The communities on the West Highland Line would be seen to benefit greatly from a similar policy, the main areas of improvement being:

1. Better commuting opportunities between Glasgow, Dumbarton and Arrochar where the successful introduction of a morning commuter service from Arrochar to Glasgow would warrant a corresponding evening return service.
2. More commuting opportunities around Oban (and Fort William).
3. More services serving Oban and at more evenly spaced times throughout the day.
4. More seating capacity on trains.
5. Better connections in to other rail services and also other forms of public transport.

This report attempts to address these issues and will suggest different service levels. The report will also estimate the cost of additional staff and increases in diesel unit mileage in order to facilitate the necessary decisions to be made.

Executive Summary

- Enhancement of Oban services is desirable and is shown to be achievable;
- Four trains to/from Oban run on certain days of the year currently, namely on Saturdays between Easter and October: this could be enhanced immediately, depending on how traincrews are rostered at Queen Street and if the quota of staff could cover these trains Monday to Friday;
- Five trains daily would enhance the service to allow for greater travel opportunities for regular education, work and business at each end of the route;
- Six trains daily is achievable by a simple combination of the four and five train option and could be run purely as a summer enhanced service, depending on economic assessment;
- There would be no requirement to increase the number of Class 156 units allocated to the service provided that the present number of nine in the summer period could be made available for most of the year;
- A train service of five trains daily or greater would require additional traincrews to be recruited for both Glasgow Queen Street and Oban depots: a variation of the six train option would not require additional staff based at Oban, only at Glasgow Queen Street, but would require to operate all year.

Background

The network of West Highland Lines are now formed of the former North British railway between Glasgow Queen Street and Fort William, opened in 1894, the Fort William to Mallaig Extension Line, opened by the North British Railway in 1901 and the former Caledonian Line between Crianlarich and Oban. This line originally started from Dunblane via Callander to Crianlarich but was closed under the Beeching Axe in 1965. The different lines were linked by a connecting line between Crianlarich Upper (North British) and Crianlarich Lower (Caledonian) opened in 1897 which is now the route used by Oban trains.

The lines transferred fully from steam to diesel operation in 1962 and diesel multiple units (Sprinters) were introduced in January 1989. This allowed trains to divide and join at Crianlarich and lower running costs, plus quicker journey times, allowed an increase of services to four trains each way plus the London Euston to Fort William sleeper service. However, the service was cut back to three sprinters daily between Glasgow and Oban and Fort William in May 1992, a situation which continues to this day.

In 1988 the route was converted from traditional single line token block working to Radio Electronic Token Block (RETB). All signal boxes were closed except for Fort William Junction and a new control centre for the whole route was opened at Banavie. This was sited here in order to facilitate working of the swing bridge over the Caledonian Canal.

An additional summer Saturday service of one train each way between Glasgow and Oban was introduced in recent years, principally to relieve overcrowding due to the large increase in passenger numbers during the summer. This train now runs on each Saturday between Easter and the end of October.

Whilst certain improvements have been made to services, notably the introduction of the 0708 (Saturdays Excepted) Arrochar to Glasgow commuter train, there have been no further initiatives taken to attempt to improve and increase the number of train services. Part of the reason has been the constraints placed on First ScotRail in terms of resources (crews and units) and the extension of services around Glasgow and Edinburgh has meant considerable recruiting of staff in the areas where they are most needed. Also, the rostering of resources requires that, currently, Class 156 units on West Highland services are required to work peak hour services in and out of Glasgow Queen Street. For example, the afternoon

service from the north, arriving in Queen Street at 1528 will form a train to Stirling (or Alloa) and back before returning to the West Highlands at 1821.

In the winter period, there are six class 156 units allocated to the service, increasing to nine sets in summer. This allows First ScotRail to allocate the three spare sets to commuter workings in winter when passenger numbers increase because of students travelling to and from colleges and universities.

This report hopes to show that an enhanced service can make use of nine sets or fewer. Clearly an enhanced service will benefit both local passengers and tourists but the increase in local populations in certain areas of the route in recent years has shifted the old fashioned notions of Highland routes being busy in summer and carrying only a handful of passengers in winter. Social changes have meant an increase in all year tourism, more weekend travel and an increase in the number of retired people living in these areas; all contribute to a growing demand for enhanced year round services.

It is envisaged that transport policy of further electrification and the opening of new lines (e.g. Airdrie to Bathgate, Glasgow Airport Rail Link) will encourage more of the shorter suburban routes to also be electrified (Cumbernauld, Anniesland lines) thus creating more spare capacity amongst diesel powered rolling stock. Although the various dates of introduction may not necessarily coincide it is hoped that the increased use of nine class 156 sets would still incorporate key peak time services at Queen Street for the required foreseeable future and this will be discussed in the report.

Service Level Options

Existing Service. The existing West Highland service is contained within the Working Timetable, Section GA, published by Network Rail, and also Table 227 of the National Rail Timetable, available on the Network Rail website.

This service comprises the London Euston to Fort William sleeper service which provides a local service north of Glasgow (and the fourth train of the day to/from Fort William and Glasgow) plus three Sprinter services which join and divide at Crianlarich for Oban and Mallaig. There is an additional local Sprinter service between Fort William and Mallaig giving a total of four services daily between those two points.

On Saturdays between the end of March and the end of October there is an additional Oban service, departing Queen Street at 1037 and returning from Oban at 1611.

Option 1 : Four Trains Per Day between Glasgow and Oban.

By referring to the existing West Highland service is contained within the Working Timetable, Section GA, published by Network Rail, and also Table 227 of the National Rail Timetable, available on the Network Rail website, the increase of a daily service to four trains to Oban can be achieved by running the 1037 Glasgow to Oban and 1611 Oban to Glasgow (Saturday service) on each weekday.

Additional costs :

Traincrew : One additional Queen Street train crew diagram on Mondays to Fridays throughout the year plus on Saturdays between November and March. Annual cost of additional staff (plus spare capacity to cover) – approx. £110k *[unless First ScotRail have already factored the additional crew in to the allocation of staff to cover the Summer Saturday requirement.]*

Class 156 unit : One additional Class 156 set rostered from existing fleet. Additional mileage incurred: 1000 miles per summer week, 1200 miles per winter week, approximate annual mileage – 56,000 miles.

Advantages:

1. One additional service to/from Oban, giving the desired figure of four trains daily on each Highland route as decreed by HITRANS in its 2007 Regional Transport Study
2. Existing train paths are available
3. Better spread of services which could discourage overcrowding on 1221 ex Queen Street and 1811 ex Oban
4. No train crew exchanges en route (Queen Street crew out and back)
5. Additional daily service, at suitable times for off-peak travel to/from Loch Lomond and Trossachs National Park.

Disadvantages:

1. Earliest arrival in Glasgow from Oban still 1128
2. No early arrival at Oban before 0900
3. No return commuter service from Glasgow to Arrochar in late afternoon
4. No later departure from Glasgow after 1821

Option 2a : Five Trains Per Day between Glasgow and Oban (early arrivals in both Glasgow and Oban

There is a growing demand for a better service between Glasgow and Oban due to increases in population along the route. Oban remains the largest town in Scotland that has the minimum rail service. Other destinations such as Mallaig, Kyle and Wick have, or are going to have, a regular year round service of four trains, the size and importance of Oban warrant a re-cast. The town's Tourist Information Centre is the busiest in Scotland, after Edinburgh.

The greatest need is for an early arrival in Glasgow from Oban as well as a return from Glasgow in both early evening and later than the present time of 1821. This would allow later departures in the south to connect in Glasgow after 2000. The following table shows an outline of the proposed timetable option:

HABTRANS CONSULTANCY LTD

Station					Ex Euston		
Edinburgh					0450		
Queen Street		0530				0821	
Westerton		05a44			0556	08/31	
Dalmuir		05/48			06a05	08a42	
Helensburgh		06a00			06c28	09e06	
Garelochhead		06a11			06b41	09a17	
Arrochar		06a31			07a06	09a37	
Ardlui		06X53			07R20	09bX53	
Crianlarich arr		0709			0740	1009	<<
Crianlarich dep		0712			0742	10X15	1018
Dalmally		07a39				10a42	
Taynuilt		08a00				11a03	
Oban		0824				1127	
Oban (Ship)						1145	
Craignure						1230	
U Tyndrum					07c56		10c29
Bridge of O					08a13		10a43
Rannoch					08cX43		11a05
Tulloch					09a18		11a33
Roy Bridge			0747				
Spean Bridge			07X57		09a37		11X54
Fort William arr			0812		0954		1207
Fort William dep				0835			1212
Glenfinnan				09a05			12a46
Arisaig				09a36			13a18
Mallaig				0952			1334
Edinburgh							
Queen Street		1221	1251	1637	1821	2021	
Westerton		12/31b	13/01b	16/47b	18/34	20/31b	
Dalmuir		12a42	13a12	16a55	18a42	20a42	
Helensburgh		13e06	13e36	17c20	19e06	21e06	
Garelochhead		13a17	13a47	17a31	19a17	21a17	
Arrochar		13a37	14X07	17X57	19a37	21a37	
Ardlui		13bX53	14a23	18a11	19X54	21a51	
Crianlarich arr		1409	1438	1827	2010	2208	
Crianlarich dep		14X20	1441	1830	2017	22X15	
Dalmally		14a47		18X58		22a42	
Taynuilt		15a08		19a20		23a03	
Oban		1532		1944		2327	
Oban (Ship)		1600		2145			
Craignure a		1645		2230			
U Tyndrum			14c52		20c28		
Bridge of O			15a06		20a42		
Rannoch			15a28		21X07		
Tulloch			15a56		21a35		
Spean Bridge			16a12		21a52		
Fort William arr			1625		2205		
Fort William dep			1630		2210		
Glenfinnan			17X03		22a43		
Arisaig			17a36		23a16		
Mallaig			1751		2331		

Station	07:09 Arrochar extended	Empty Stock					
Mallaig			0603			1010	
Arisaig			06a19			10a26	
Glenfinnan			06a55			10a58	
Fort William arr			0725			1132	
Fort William dep		07+15	0742			1140	
Spean Bridge		07t28	07a55			11X53	
Roy Bridge		07+35					
Tulloch			08a13			12a11	
Rannoch			08jX43			12a43	
Bridge of O			09a03			13a02	
U Tyndrum			09c19			14c05	
Craignure				0700	1055		
Oban (Ship)				0745	1140		
Oban	0525			0900	1211		
Taynuilt	05a49			09a24	12a35		
Dalmally	06a10			09a45	13X00		
Crianlarich arr	0635		0929	1012	1327	1332	
Crianlarich dep	0637		0935	10X16	1336	<<	
Ardlui	06X53		09X52	10R32	13X52		
Arrochar	07X09		10a07	10a47	14X07		
Garelochhead	07a30		10a29	11a07	14a27		
Helensburgh	07c42		10c41	11a19	14a39		
Westerton	08/13		11/11	11/47	15/15		
Queen Street	0828 A		1128	1158	1528		
Mallaig				1610	1815		
Arisaig				16a26	18a31		
Glenfinnan				17X03	19a03		
Fort William arr				1737	1937		
Fort William dep				1742		1950	
Spean Bridge				17a55		20a10	
Tulloch				18a13		20a30	
Rannoch				18a41		21X06	
Bridge of O				19a02		21a34	
U Tyndrum				19c17		21c52	
Craignure		1500	1700				
Oban (Ship)		1545	1745				
Oban		1611	1811				
Taynuilt		16a35	18a35				
Dalmally		16a56	18X56				
Crianlarich arr		1727	1927	1929		2204	
Crianlarich dep		1730	1936	1936		22X12	
Ardlui		17a46	>>	19X53		22R30	
Arrochar		17X59		20a08		22a50	
Garelochhead		18a19		20X28		23a15	
Helensburgh		18a40		20a40		23a28	
Dalmuir		19a04		21a04		23a49	
Westerton		19/11		21/11		23a56	2359
Queen Street		1928		2128			0019

5 trains to/from Oban timetable summary

A – Retime 0742 from Falkirk Grahamston to arrive 0834 and 0527 from Aberdeen to arrive 0831

X – crosses train at loop travelling in opposite direction; / - passing time

R – request stop only

a – arrives one minute earlier; b – arrives one and a half minutes earlier;

c – arrives two minutes earlier; e – arrives three minutes earlier; j – arrives five minutes earlier

This 5 train option requires a third Oban traincrew diagram:

Oban 1	0505 – 1205	Oban 2	1150 – 2005	Oban 3	1750 - 2350
Oban	0525	Oban	1211	Oban	1811
Ardlui	0650 0653	Q St	1528 PNB	Ardlui	1951 1953
Oban	0824 PNB		1637	C'larich	2008 PNB
Oban	0900	Oban	1944	C'larich	2215
C'larich	1012 1015			Oban	2327
Oban	1127 PNB				

Alterations to Fort William traincrew workings are shown below. The 1950 Fort William to Euston would the crew to work to Crianlarich instead of Rannoch and return to Fort William by taxi, five nights per week, Monday to Friday.

Ft Wm 1	0715 – 1645	Ft Wm 2	0655 – 1355	Ft Wm 3	1610 - 2359
Ft Wm	0742	Ft Wm	0715	Ft Wm	1630
Rannoch	0838 0843	R Bdge	0735 0747	Mallaig	1751 PNB
Rannoch	0954 DISP	Ft Wm	0812 0835	Mallaig	1815
	PNB	Mallaig	0952 1010	Ft Wm	1937 1950
Ft William	1140	Ft Wm	1132 PNB	C'larich	2204 PNB
Arrochar	1405 1407			C'larich TAXI	22+30
Ft William	1625			Ft Wm	23+40

Mallaig 1 turn: works as at present BUT Queen St crew on returning passenger from Rannoch should relieve Mallaig 1 at Crianlarich and work 0603 Mallaig - Glasgow between Crianlarich and Ardlui, to be further relieved by Queen Street crew off 0821.

Queen Street crew works 0530 ex Queen Street to Ardlui & 0521 ex Oban return: turn similar to present one where ECS working to Arrochar required.

Queen Street crew works 0821 to Ardlui for 0742 ex Ft Wm, relieve Q Street crew off sleeper working: A further Q St crew (present 0851 summer Glasgow – Mallaig train) would work 0821 to Crianlarich for 0900 ex Oban; this crew would then work 1251 to Arrochar, changeover with Ft William 1 crew, returning as passengers to Queen Street.

Queen Street crew works 1221 ex Q St and 1611 ex Oban – ADDITIONAL TRAINCREW

Queen Street crew works 1821 to Ardlui and return with 1811 ex Oban (as today)

Queen Street crew works 2021 ex Q St to Crianlarich, thence Fort William to Euston service from Crianlarich to Dalmuir vice travelling passenger to Rannoch per 1821 service.

When 0821 runs in summer as 6-car set, set diagram alterations MAY be needed to provide a set for 0755 Q St to Anniesland and 0823 Anniesland – QSt. [Could run 0525 ex Oban to call all stations from Maryhill (0827) & arrive Queen St 0840 and cancel 0755 Q St to Anniesland.]

EXTRA TRAINCREW REQUIREMENT: one diagram at Queen Street and one at Oban.

Set 1				Set 2			
Queen St		0530		Oban		0900	1/2
Crianlarich	0709	0712		Queen St	1158	1251	2/1
Oban	0824	0900	1/2	Mallaig	1751	1815	
Queen St	1158	1251	2/1	Ft William	1937		
Ft William	1625						
		WORKS 8					WORKS 7
 Set 3				 Set 4			
Oban		0525		Queen St		0821	4/5/6
Queen St	0828	1221	9/3	Oban	1127	1211	
Oban	1527	1611		Queen St	1528	1648	4/7/8
Queen St	1928			Dunblane	1753	1812	
				Queen St	1903	2021	
				Oban	2327	WORKS 3	
 Sets 5 & 6				 Set 7			
Queen St		0821	4/5/6	Ft William		07+15	ECS
Mallaig	1334	1610		Roy Bridge	07+35	0747	
Queen St	2129		9/6/5	Ft William	0812	0835	7/8
				Mallaig	0952	1010	8/7
				Queen St	1528	FUEL or	
						PEAK	
				Queen St		1821	
				Mallaig	2331	WORKS 9	
 Set 8				 Set 9			
Ft William		0835	7/8	Mallaig		0603	
Mallaig	0952	1010	8/7	Queen St	1128	1221	9/3
Queen St	1528	1637		Oban	1527	1811	
Oban	1944	WORKS 2		Queen St	2129		9/6/5

On Summer Fridays, 2021 Queen Street to Oban could be strengthened by addition of Set 3 to Set 4 and set run as empty stock from Crianlarich to Fort William (crew off sleeper) for attaching to 0742 ex Fort William on Saturdays.

In winter sets 6 and 8 would not be required for strengthening purposes. In winter, 1251 Queen Street to Mallaig could depart at 1221 worked by Set 6 on rear of Sets 9 and 3. Sets 1 and 2 would therefore become spare units after arrival at Queen Street at 1158

Additional costs :

Traincrew : One additional Queen street train crew diagram and one additional Oban diagram. Annual cost of additional staff (plus spare capacity to cover) – approx. £300k

Class 156 unit : Present summer complement of nine sets required.

ADDITIONAL MILEAGE INCURRED	PER WEEK	PER YEAR
Two early trains (currently SX), 5 days per week extended between Arrochar & Oban	785	40,820
One early train in each direction on Saturdays: Glasgow/Oban	200	10,400
One late afternoon train, 1637 Glasgow to Oban	600	31,200
One late afternoon train, 1611 Oban to Glasgow less thirty Saturdays throughout year train currently runs	600	28,200
TOTALS	2185	110,620

Advantages:

1. Two additional services to/from Oban, giving the desired level of service favoured by HITRANS.
2. All services, except for 1637 and 2021 Queen Street to Oban, are existing train paths
3. Better spread of services which could discourage overcrowding
4. Early arrivals in Glasgow and Oban and corresponding late afternoon departures will enhance commuting opportunities
5. Later evening departure from Queen Street enhancing connections from the south: from London around 1400 and Edinburgh at 1900.

Disadvantages:

1. Additional train crews required which could delay introduction of service
2. Still some reliance on portion working south of Crianlarich
3. Train crew changeovers en route still required

Option 2b: Five Trains Per Day between Glasgow and Oban (early arrival in Glasgow)

There is a growing demand for a better service between Glasgow and Oban due to increases in population along the route. Oban remains the largest town in Scotland that has the minimum rail service. Other destinations such as Mallaig, Kyle and Wick have, or are going to have, a regular year round service of four trains, the size and importance of Oban warrant a better spread of departures from Glasgow throughout the day including the present Saturday 1037 departure running throughout the week.

Station			Ex Euston			
Edinburgh			0450			
Queen Street				0821		1037
Westerton			0556	08/31		10/47
Dalmuir			06a05	08a42		10a58
Helensburgh			06c28	09c06		11c22
Garelochhead			06b41	09a17		11a33
Arrochar			07a06	09a37		11a53
Ardlui			07R20	09bX53		12a07
Crianlarich arr			0740	1009	<<	1223
Crianlarich dep			0742	10X15	1018	1226
Dalmally				10a42		12X58
Taynuilt				11a03		13a20
Oban				1127		1344
Oban (Ship)				1145		
Craignure				1230		
U Tyndrum			07c56		10c29	
Bridge of O			08a13		10a43	
Rannoch			08cX43		11a05	
Tulloch			09a18		11a33	
Roy Bridge	0747					
Spean Bridge	07X57		09a37		11X54	
Fort William arr	0812		0954		1207	
Fort William dep		0835			1212	
Glenfinnan		09a05			12a46	
Arisaig		09a36			13a18	
Mallaig		0952			1334	

Station					
Edinburgh					
Queen Street	1221		1637	1821	2021
Westerton	<i>12/31b</i>		<i>16/47b</i>	<i>18/34</i>	<i>20/31b</i>
Dalmuir	12a42		16a55	18a42	20a42
Helensburgh	13e06		17c20	19e06	21e06
Garelochhead	13a17		17a31	19a17	21a17
Arrochar	13a37		17X57	19a37	21a37
Ardlui	13bX53		18a11	19X54	21a51
Crianlarich arr	1409	<<<	1827	2010	2208
Crianlarich dep	14X20	1423	1830	2017	22X15
Dalmally	14a47		18X58		22a42
Taynuilt	15a08		19a20		23a03
Oban	1532		1944		2327
Oban (Ship)	<i>1600</i>		<i>2145</i>		
Craignure	<i>1645</i>		<i>2230</i>		
U Tyndrum		14c34		20c28	
Bridge of O		14a48		20a42	
Rannoch		15a10		21X07	
Tulloch		15a38		21a35	
Roy Bridge					
Spean Bridge		15a55		21a52	
Fort William arr		1608		2205	
Fort William dep		1625		2210	
Glenfinnan		17X03		22a43	
Arisaig		17a36		23a16	
Mallaig		1751		2331	
Station	07:09 Arrochar extended	Empty Stock			
Mallaig			0603		1010
Arisaig			06a19		10a26
Glenfinnan			06a55		10a58
Fort William arr			0725		1132
Fort William dep		07+15	0742		1140
Spean Bridge		07t28	07a55		11X53
Roy Bridge		07+35			
Tulloch			08a13		12a11
Rannoch			08jX43		12a43
Bridge of O			09a03		13a02
U Tyndrum			09c19		14c05
Craignure				<i>0700</i>	<i>1055</i>
Oban (Ship)				<i>0745</i>	<i>1140</i>
Oban	0525		0811	1211	
Taynuilt	05a49		08a35	12a35	
Dalmally	06a10		08a56	13X00	
Crianlarich arr	0635		0929	1327	1332
Crianlarich dep	0637		0935	<<<	<<
Ardlui	06X53		09X52	13X52	
Arrochar	07X09		10a07	14X07	
Garelochhead	07a30		10a29	14a27	
Helensburgh	07c42		10c41	14a39	
Westerton	<i>08/13</i>		<i>11/11</i>	<i>15/15</i>	
Queen Street	0828 A		1128	1528	

Mallaig				1610	1815	
Arisaig				16a26	18a31	
Glenfinnan				17X03	19a03	
Fort William arr				1737	1937	
Fort William dep				1742		1950
Spean Bridge				17a55		20a10
Tulloch				18a13		20a30
Rannoch				18a41		21X06
Bridge of O				19a02		21a34
U Tyndrum				19c17		21c52
Craignure		1500	1700			
Oban (Ship)		1545	1745			
Oban		1611	1811			
Taynuilt		16a35	18a35			
Dalmally		16a56	18X56			
Crianlarich arr		1727	1927	1929		2204
Crianlarich dep		1730	1936	1936		22X12
Ardlui		17a46	>>	19X53		22R30
Arrochar		17X59		20a08		22a50
Garelochhead		18a19		20X28		23a15
Helensburgh		18a40		20a40		23a28
Dalmuir		19a04		21a04		23a49
Westerton		19/11		21/11		23a56
Queen Street		1928		2128		

5 trains to/from Oban timetable summary

A – Retime 0742 from Falkirk Grahamston to arrive 0834 and 0527 from Aberdeen to arrive 0831

X – crosses train at loop travelling in opposite direction; / - passing time

R – request stop only

a – arrives one minute earlier; b – arrives one and a half minutes earlier;

c – arrives two minutes earlier; e – arrives three minutes earlier; j – arrives five minutes earlier

This second five train option requires **four** Oban train crew diagrams:

Oban 1 0505 – 1405 Oban 2 0750 – 1545 Oban 3 1515 - 2045

Oban	0525	Oban	0811	Oban	1611
Q St	0828 PNB	Q St	1128 PNB	Arrochar	1757 1759
Q St	1037		1221	Oban	1944 PNB
Oban	1344	Oban	1527		

Oban 4 1745 – 1405

Oban	1811
Ardlui	1952 1954
Crianlarich	2010 PNB
	2215
Oban	2327

Alterations to Fort William train crew workings are shown as in Option 2a above.

Queen Street crews would be limited to working the 0821 to Oban, returning with the 1211 from Oban and working the 1821 to Ardlui, returning with 1811 Oban – Queen Street from Ardlui.

The 2021 to Oban would be worked to Crianlarich by the Glasgow crew for the sleeper service. This would still require the Fort William crew to return to Fort William from Crianlarich by taxi.

Set 1				Set 2				
Queen St		1221	9/2/1	Oban		0811		
Fort William	1605			Queen St	1128	1221	2/1	
				Mallaig	1751	1815		
				Ft William	1937			
		WORKS 8				WORKS 7		
Set 3				Set 4				
Oban		0525		Queen St		0821	4/5/6	
Queen St	0828	1037		Oban	1127	1211		
Oban	1344	1611		Queen St	1528	1648	4/7/8	
Queen St	1928			Dunblane	1753	1812		
				Queen St	1903	2021		
				Oban	2327			
		WORKS 2				WORKS 3		
Sets 5 & 6				Set 7				
Queen St		0821	4/5/6	Ft William		07+15	ECS	
Mallaig	1334	1610		Roy Bridge	07+35	0747		
Queen St	2129		9/6/5	Ft William	0812	0835	7/8	
				Mallaig	0952	1010	8/7	
				Queen St	1528	FUEL or PEAK		
				Queen St		1821	7/1	
				Mallaig	2331	WORKS 9		
Set 8				Set 9				
Ft William		0835	7/8	Mallaig		0603	9/2	
Mallaig	0952	1010	8/7	Queen St	1128	1221	9/2/1	
Queen St	1528	1637		Oban	1527	1811		
Oban	1944	WORKS 2			Queen St	2129	9/6/5	

Additional costs :

Traincrew : Two additional Oban train crew diagrams. Annual cost of additional staff (plus spare capacity to cover, totalling eight additional staff): approx. £350k.

Class 156 unit : Present summer complement of nine sets required.

ADDITIONAL MILEAGE INCURRED	PER WEEK	PER YEAR
One late afternoon train, 1611 Oban to Glasgow less thirty Saturdays throughout year train currently runs	600	28,200
1037 Queen Street to Oban, daily less thirty Saturdays throughout year train currently runs	600	28,200
0709 Arrochar to Glasgow extended to start from Oban daily	348	18,096
TOTALS	1,548	74,496

Advantages:

1. Two additional year-round services to/from Oban, giving the desired level of service favoured by HITRANS.
2. All services, except for 1637 and 2021 Queen Street to Oban, are existing train paths
3. Better spread of services which could discourage overcrowding
4. Early arrival in Glasgow and corresponding late afternoon departure will enhance commuting opportunities
5. Later evening departure from Queen Street enhancing connections from the south: from London around 1400 and Edinburgh at 1900.

Disadvantages:

1. Additional train crews required which could delay introduction of service
2. Still portion working south of Crianlarich
3. Train crew changeovers en route still required

Option 3a: Six Trains Per Day between Glasgow and Oban

This option will require additional traincrews to be based at Oban as per five train option.

With the growing demand for a better service between Glasgow and Oban, still particularly during summer weekends, the five train option could be increased to six by the inclusion of the Saturday train to/from Oban as highlighted in the present service and four train option. The benefit of the 1037 Glasgow to Oban is that it would be able to run as many days as the market demanded, without interference to other West Highland services, passenger, freight or charter.

In the opposite direction (after arrival in Oban at 1344) the additional service would require to depart at 1430, arriving in Queen Street at 1744, as the five train option already calls for the 1611 Oban to Queen Street to run daily throughout the year, serving schoolchildren and commuters from Oban.

These trains would provide excellent connections in and out of shipping services between Oban and the Outer Isles and therefore could run at peak tourist periods when through travel would justify the service even more.

The 1037 from Queen Street and 1430 from Oban would require an additional traincrew turn at Glasgow.

[For summary of timetable, refer to pages 22 and 23 of this report.]

Additional costs :

Traincrew: Two additional Queen street train crew diagrams and one additional Oban diagram. Annual cost of additional staff (plus spare capacity to cover): approx. £450k.

Class 156 unit : Present summer complement of nine sets required.

ADDITIONAL MILEAGE INCURRED	PER WEEK	PER YEAR
Two early trains, 5 days per week extended between Arrochar & Oban	785	40,820
One early train in each direction on Saturdays: Glasgow/Oban	200	10,400
One late afternoon train, 1637 Glasgow to Oban	600	31,200
One late afternoon train, 1611 Oban to Glasgow less thirty Saturdays throughout year train currently runs	600	28,200
1037 Queen Street to Oban and 1430 Oban to Queen Street @ 200 miles per day	1200	36,000 (for 30 weeks per year)
TOTALS	3385	146,620

Advantages:

1. Three additional services to/from Oban, giving the desired level of service favoured by HITRANS.
2. All services, except for 1637 and 2021 Queen Street to Oban, and 1430 Oban to Queen Street, are existing train paths
3. Service every two hours at certain times of the day, competitive with road transport
4. Good connections with shipping services at Oban
5. Earliest West Coast Main Line arrivals in Glasgow are now before 1000 giving good connection in to 1037 to Oban

Disadvantages:

1. Additional traincrews required which could delay introduction of service
2. Perhaps seen as an excessive service for the route and capabilities of RETB system would require to be assessed.

Option 3b: Six Trains Per Day between Glasgow and Oban

With the growing demand for a better service between Glasgow and Oban, still particularly during summer weekends, the five train option could be increased to six by the inclusion of the Saturday train to/from Oban as highlighted in the present service and four train option. The benefit of the 1037 Glasgow to Oban is that it would be able to run as many days as the market demanded, without interference to other West Highland services, passenger, freight or charter.

In the opposite direction the additional service would depart at 2025, arriving in Queen Street at 2335.

[For summary of timetable, refer to pages 22 and 23 of this report.]

This 6 train option does **not** require 3 Oban train crew diagrams but does require additional Queen Street turns of duty:

Oban 1 0505 – 1405 Oban 2 1550 – 2350

Oban	0525	Oban	1611
Q St	0828 PNB	Q St	1928 PNB
	1037		2021
Oban	1344	Oban	2327

Q St 1 0505 – 1215 Q St 2 0800 – 1548 Q St 3 1200 – 2145

Q St	0530	Q St	0821	Q St	1221
Oban	0824 PNB	Oban	1127 PNB	Oban	1527 PNB
	0900		1211		1811
Q St	1158 PNB	Q St	1528	Q St	2128

Q St 4 1615 – 2355

Q St	1637
Oban	1944 PNB
	2025
Q St	2335

The 1821 Queen Street to Mallaig service would be covered by the evening sleeper crew to Crianlarich where they would relieve the southbound Fort William crew at 2205 (see under 5 train option).

EXTRA TRAINCREW REQUIREMENT: two diagrams at Queen Street (turns 3 and 4)

Additional costs :

Traincrew: Two additional Queen street train crew diagrams only. Annual cost of additional staff (plus spare capacity to cover) – approx. £350k

Class 156 unit : Present summer complement of nine sets required.

ADDITIONAL MILEAGE INCURRED	PER WEEK	PER YEAR
Two early trains, 5 days per week extended between Arrochar & Oban	785	40,820
One early train in each direction on Saturdays: Glasgow/Oban	200	10,400
One late afternoon train, 1637 Glasgow to Oban	600	31,200
One evening train, 2025 Oban to Glasgow	600	31,200
1037 Queen Street to Oban and 1611 Oban to Queen Street @ 200 miles per day	1200	36,000 (for 30 weeks per year)
TOTALS	3385	149,620

Advantages:

1. Three additional services to/from Oban, giving the desired level of service favoured by HITRANS.
2. All services, except for 1637 and 2021 Queen Street to Oban, and 2025 Oban to Queen Street, are existing train paths
3. Regular service throughout the day, competitive with road transport
4. Good connections with shipping services at Oban
5. Earliest West Coast Main Line arrivals in Glasgow are now before 1000 giving good connection in to 1037 to Oban

Disadvantages:

1. Additional traincrews required which could delay introduction of service although all additional work centred at Glasgow Queen Street.
2. Perhaps seen as an excessive service for the route; capabilities of the RETB system would require to be assessed
3. No connections for Edinburgh or Ayr at Glasgow off 2025 ex Oban.
4. If it were to be decided to run only five trains each way in winter periods with no additional Oban crew, the trains needing removed would be the 1037 from Queen Street and the 1611 from Oban; these are viewed as two of the busiest services.

Conclusions

The remit of the study was to determine what alterations and improvements could be made to the Oban service (without necessarily affecting Fort William trains) that is seen to be at the correct quantum of service level.

Connections at Crianlarich between Oban and Mallaig trains have been maintained with the exception of the 1610 Mallaig to Queen Street that has no connection for Oban at Crianlarich (1930) until 2215. Through tickets could be made available which would be valid over the entire West Highland Line to Helensburgh, where passengers could change in to the 2021 Queen Street to Oban service.

Performance is also of key importance and there is a requirement for fewer train sets to join at Crianlarich (before heading south) due to the long distance trains must travel from Mallaig. There may be issues of RETB capability with extra trains although when the signalling system was commissioned in 1988 there was a far greater amount of freight traffic on the route than today.

Certain alterations to Fort William train crews are proposed. There may be the desire, on the part of First ScotRail to extend Fort William crews through to Glasgow and Glasgow crews through to Fort William, in order to extend route knowledge and allow for depots to cover at either end in times of staff shortage. The frequent late running of the northbound sleeper produces a risk where the Fort William crew shown to work the 1140 Fort William to Glasgow after working the sleeper could be seen as less than robust.

The proposed services are viewed as workable and more attractive, thus having the potential for increasing revenue and fulfilling greater social obligation as well as tourist services. The resourcing will be a matter of discussion within the rail industry and its funders.

As the five train (and first six train) option incurs additional train crew based at Oban, whereas the second six train option requires the additional resources at Glasgow Queen Street only, the second six train option might appear to be more economically justifiable but running all year round. Of the two five train options put forward, the second

would, although giving a better spread of services at more convenient times, be far more costly to implement and over a longer timescale (for recruitment and training purposes).

Summary of Timetable Options:

Present service:

Glasgow Queen Street depart	0821	1221	1821
Oban arrive	1127	1527	2127

Oban depart	0811	1211	1811
Glasgow Queen Street arrive	1128	1526	2129

An additional Saturday only service operates between March & October departing Glasgow at 1037 and returning from Oban at 1611.

4 Trains Per Day:

Glasgow Queen Street depart	0821	1037	1221	1821
Oban arrive	1127	1344	1527	2127

Oban depart	0811	1211	1611	1811
Glasgow Queen Street arrive	1128	1526	1928	2129

5 Trains Per Day (Option a – three Oban train crew diagrams):

Glasgow Queen Street depart	0530	0821	1221	1637	2021
Oban arrive	0824	1127	1527	1944	2327

Oban depart	0525	0900	1211	1611	1811
Glasgow Queen Street arrive	0828	1158	1528	1928	2129

The 0530 service from Queen Street would provide a connection (for stations to Fort William) in to the London – Fort William sleeper service.

5 Trains Per Day (Option b – four Oban train crew diagrams):

Glasgow Queen Street depart	0821	1037	1221	1637	2021
Oban arrive	1127	1344	1527	1944	2327

Oban depart	0525	0811	1211	1611	1811
Glasgow Queen Street arrive	0828	1128	1528	1928	2129

6 Trains Per Day (first option: additional Oban traincrew required):

Glasgow Queen Street depart	0530	0821	1037	1221	1637	2021
Oban arrive	0824	1127	1344	1527	1944	2327

Oban depart	0525	0900	1211	1430	1611	1811
Glasgow Queen St arrive	0828	1158	1526	1744	1928	2128

6 Trains Per Day (second option: no additional Oban traincrew required):

Glasgow Queen Street depart	0530	0821	1037	1221	1637	2021
Oban arrive	0824	1127	1344	1527	1944	2327

Oban depart	0525	0900	1211	1611	1811	2025
Glasgow Queen St arrive	0828	1158	1526	1928	2128	2335

It should be noted that where trains do not have to either divide or join with Mallaig portions at Crianlarich, a time saving can be made: three minutes in northbound direction and five minutes in southbound direction.

Actual end-to-end journey times will vary according to North Electric services and pathing requirements across Cowlairs Junction, particularly at peak times.