



Largs Sailing Club, Largs Yacht Haven on Tuesday 6<sup>th</sup> September 2016

**Present –**

Paul Flynn, Transport Scotland  
Brian Gordon, Transport Scotland  
Graham Laidlaw, Transport Scotland  
Drew Collier, Calmac Ferries Limited  
Ross Moran, Calmac Ferries Limited  
Demi Wyllie, Calmac Ferries Limited  
Blair Moglia, Calmac Ferries Limited  
Bill Steele, Cumbrae Ferry Committee  
Cllr Robert E MacIntyre, Argyll and Bute Council  
Cllr John Armour, Argyll and Bute Council also representing Campbeltown Ferry Committee  
Kerr Corbett, Scottish Citylink  
Stephen Hagan, David MacBrayne Group Limited  
Kevin Hobbs, CMAL  
Jim Anderson, CMAL  
Cllr John Bruce, North Ayrshire Council  
Bill Calderwood, Arran Ferry Committee  
Ranald Robertson, HITRANS

In the absence of the regular Chair (Cllr McEleny) Graham Laidlaw agreed to step in and Chair the meeting.

**1. Minute of meeting of 19 February**

Agreed as an accurate reflection of the discussion.

**2. Matters Arising not on the Agenda**

No matters raised.

**3. CalMac Summer 2017 Timetable Proposals**

Drew Collier spoke to the Summer 2017 timetable pack.

Some discussion followed on the detail and status of the requests received.

Arran Ferry Committee have developed business cases for their requests to help justify the additional financial costs by demonstrating benefits.

Action - CalMac agreed to circulate an update setting out the process and stages as they progress.

#### **4. CalMac Ferries Limited presentation on the new CHFS Contract starting 1 October**

Drew Collier presented on some high level details of the new CHFS contract. The presentation covered:

##### ITT Parameters

- fares set by Transport Scotland
- Routes and timetables set by TS and based on Summer 2015 for pricing purposes.
- Must use CMAL vessels
- Fixed price contract
- 

##### Key High Level Changes to the new contract

- New Harbour Operating Agreement
- Tightly defined reporting arrangements
- Performance regime against KPIs.
- Introduction of Smart Ticketing
- New transport integration arrangements
- New accessibility and environmental requirements
- Detailed stakeholder relationship structure
- Operator responsible for vessel maintenance obligations..
- 

##### Bid Summary

- Aim to meet the needs of communities, customer, stakeholder, sister agencies and Scottish Ministers
- Deliver long term subsidy reduction by growing revenue and operational improvements.
- Will continue to create long term social and economic value.

##### 7 themes that underpin the outcomes for service

- Safety
- Value for money
- Developing sustainable communities
- Being a socially responsible employer.
- Improving customer service.
- Enduring commitment to environmental sustainability.
- Managing change effectively.

##### Improving customer service

- £6M investment in on board and port improvements to passenger areas.
- Daily management of demand for deck space to improve capacity.
  - o New terms and conditions to discourage no shows.

- Improve Quality of customer travel information at ports and on vessels – particularly during disruption.
- Appoint Transport Integration Manager to work with other providers on timetable connections.
- Innovative approach to smart ticketing.

#### Engaging and developing sustainable communities

- Appointed Brian Fulton as Director of Communities
- Create a Communities Board with the commitment to have this up and running by December 2017.
- Consult local and national user groups.
- Maximise procurement opportunities for SMEs.
- 80% target for local fresh produce (From 50% today)
- Continue to provide opportunities for direct local employment including apprentices.

#### Other points

- No compulsory redundancy policy.
- Build on status as a
- Appoint Environment Manager
- Have Transport Integration Manager appointed by 1 October.

Key points from the subsequent group discussion included:

Multi journey ticketing and smart ticketing targets. There are ongoing issues with ticket validation within the SPT Concessionary Fares system.

How to implement no show management and what role stakeholders can provide on supporting the development and delivery of such a new system.

Availability to book online research needs to be married with subsequent vessel deck allocation retrospectively.

Tension exists between reservable operations and turn up and go. All solutions should not be tailored to suit the bookable service only as the needs of each route type are very different.

### **5. Transport Scotland Presentation on Vessel Replacement and Deployment Plan**

Graham Laidlaw presented on the Vessel Replacement and Deployment Plan. The presentation provided an update on key findings from the 2015 VRDP.

#### Background

- Independent demand forecasting exercise.
- Introduced in phases to represent changes around the network.
- Annual basis and looks at July/August.

#### Key Assumptions

- Based on current timetables.
- Previous demand increases.
- Point at which demand reaches 70% across the week.

Two demand/capacity models have been developed to assist with this decision making process, one for major routes the other for minor.

#### VDRP 2014 Recommendations

- 2 new vessels needed.
- Identified Ardrossan – Brodick and Uig to Lochmaddy / Uig to Tarbert
- MV Hebrides redeployed to Oban
- MV Isle of Lewis to move to Oban to Craignure
- Recognised medium term vessel provision for Islay.

#### Progress to date on VRDP 2014

- 2 new vessels in build at FML.
- Deployment of MV Isle of Lewis to Oban to Craignure could not proceed. Discussions with ABC ongoing.
- Shoreside infrastructure requirements are being assessed and addressed.

#### Major Route Model Outputs

- Oban to Craignure remains the most critically capacity constrained route.

#### Medium / Minor Route Model Outputs

- Mallaig to Armadale is the most critically capacity constrained route.

#### RET Impacts

- All model re-runs have incorporated up to date RET increases.
- For Arran routes a distinct second year uplift is emerging.

#### Arran routes post RET

- Ardrossan – Brodick year 1 pax up 5% cars 40% year 2 7% and 10%
- Lochranza to Claonaig

#### Emerging conclusions

- Oban to Craignure remains a challenge
- New vessels will help.
- Analysis and decision needed on Islay
- Further assessment on Uig – Lochmaddy / Tarbert and Stornoway – Ullapool
- Other priorities include Mallaig – Armadale and Sound of Harris.
- Review all options for additional capacity.
- Public finances remain tight.

#### Next steps

- Ferry User Group meeting presentations.
- Finalisation of 2015 report
- Presentation to Councils and RTPs
- Submission to Ministers for approval and publication.

#### Follow up discussion included:

Desire from communities and user groups to have an opportunity to comment on the detail of the report before it is finalised.

Motor homes are often criticised but with the loss of available accommodation in a number of islands the option of encouraging mobile accommodation has been very welcome.

Net spend on the island may have reduced as visitors travel more by car and take their own provisions with them.

## **6. Performance and Operational Update**

Ross Moran provided the CalMac Operational and Performance Update for each route picking out key trends for each route and network wide.

There have been some disappointing cancellation and performance issues but the company is worked hard to adapt new ways of working and managing these issues. It is planned to begin daily publication of performance on a route by route basis.

Initiative to establish a new contract for weather information to provide Masters with the best information possible to support their decision making process.

Printable tickets are being developed for at home ticket printing.

Dry docking regime is an area where CFL would like to improve transparency and it is intended to extend invitations to communities to see the dry dock work on their vessels while it progresses.

Bill Calderwood asked if it would be possible to separate out the performance of MV. Caledonian Isles and MV Isle of Arran in the performance reporting to understand the impact of individual vessels on performance.

John Armour suggested CalMac need to undertake a PR exercise with Kintyre to explain why performance in 2016 has been so poor.

Action – Ross Moran will take an action to look at ways of engaging with Kintyre on the performance issues on Ardrossan- Campbeltown.

## **7. Public Transport and Integration**

Bill Calderwood suggested a mechanism would be good to support discussion and focus on integrated transport and Arran would clearly benefit with discussion also involved SPT as well as islands interests, ScotRail and CalMac.

John Armour highlighted that the 1 hour waiting time at Ardrossan for onward travel by rail from the Campbeltown ferry is a disincentive to travel on the Sunday evening service.

## **8. AOCB**

Graham Laidlaw provided an update from the First Minister's statement on the programme for Government on continued focus and support for ferry services.

Bill Calderwood highlighted that he has not seen anything in the published documents ahead of the new contract on what the operator might do to capture unsatisfied demand.

Drew confirmed that there is no fixed solution in mind but CFL are keen to consider this moving forward.

Bill Calderwood asked if the Independent Procurement Panel will have their wash up meeting in due course.

Graham Laidlaw confirmed this is still Alan Malone's intention and with the contract now signed this will be arranged soon.

John Bruce highlighted an incident he witnessed with a lady struggling to negotiate an incredibly steep gangway at Ardrossan.

Drew Collier agreed to take any information, log it as a risk and would welcome a copy of the photo Cllr Bruce took.

**9. Date of Next Meeting**

Action - The date of the next two meetings will be proposed by CalMac Ferries Limited to align with key consultation dates and these will be circulated by HITRANS to the Membership as soon as possible.