



FERRY USERS GROUP

(Barra, the Uists, Lewis and Harris)

Minute of Meeting held in The Caladh Hotel, on 27 April 2017 at 9.30am

| | |
|----------------------|---|
| <p>IN ATTENDANCE</p> | <p>COMHAIRLE NAN EILAN SIAR Mr John Mackay (Chairman) Mr Uisdean Robertson Mr Kenneth Macleod Mr Iain Mackinnon Mr David Smart Mr Iain Buchanan Miss Lesley McDonald Mrs Fiona Maciver</p> <p>TRANSPORT SCOTLAND Mr Richard Hadfield Mr Douglas Ellis</p> <p>CALEDONIAN MACBRAYNE LTD (CALMAC) Mr Brian Fulton Ms Blair Moglia Mr David Taylor Ms Demi Wylie Mr Robert Morrison</p> <p>CALEDONIAN MARITIME ASSETS LTD (CMAL) Mr Kevin Hobbs</p> <p>STORNOWAY PORT AUTHORITY Mr Alex Macleod</p> <p>OUTER HEBRIDES TOURISM (OHT) Mr Ian Fordham Mr Donald Macarthur</p> <p>OUTER HEBRIDES COMMERCE GROUP (OHCG) Ms Gail Robertson</p> <p>SCOTTISH CITYLINK Mr Ker Corbett</p> <p>AUDIT SCOTLAND Ms Lucy Carter Ms Lynne Conway</p> |
| <p>APOLOGIES</p> | <p>Cllr Philip McLean (CnES)</p> |

Alan MacKenzie (VisitScotland)
 David Summers (Highland Council)
 Rachel Mackenzie (HIE)
 DR MacLeod (RHA)
 Kevin Peach (Ullapool Port Authority)
 Ms Catherine Macdonald (CnES)
 Mr Neil Macrae (HITRANS)

| | | |
|---|--|---|
| 1 | Minute | The Minute of Meeting of 5 September 2016 was approved . |
| 2 | Matters Arising | <p>Uisdean Robertson highlighted that the cancellation policy had not yet been circulated.</p> <p>Action – It was agreed that CalMac representatives would check up on this.</p> |
| | | Richard Hadfield drew attention to item 5 of the Minute and indicated that it should read Ardrossan – Brodick. |
| | Matters Arising not on Agenda | There were no other matters arising. |
| 3 | Performance Audit of Scottish Government Funded Ferry Services | <p>Lucy Carter gave a presentation on the Ferries Performance Audit. The Presentation highlighted that the overall aim of the audit was to assess whether investment in lifeline ferry services was providing value for money. Evidence of progress to date was detailed in the Presentation and it was anticipated that conclusions drawn from the evidence would be completed in May 2017 with the findings of the audit due to be published on 19 October 2017.</p> <p>Action – Lucy Carter and Lynne Conway to take back to the Audit Scotland team the suggestion of community engagement with the smaller islands and the possibility of consultation with a wider range of fora e.g. tourism sector.</p> |
| 4 | Ferry Procurement Review | <p>Mr Ranald Robertson, Partnership Director, submitted a Report providing an update on the announcement of a review to be undertaken into procurement process and state aid requirements for the future funding of Scottish Government ferry services. The Report stated that the Review would ensure the continued provision of safe, efficient and effective ferry services that met the needs of island and remote rural communities and which provided value for money to the tax payer. The Review would look in detail at the implications of the Commission's response on future tendering, the Teckal exemption and State aid rules. There would be engagement with key stakeholders during the process and the Review would be overseen by the Minister for Transport and the Islands.</p> <p>Transport Scotland intended to hold five consultation meetings with one in Stornoway. However, it was felt that it would be preferable to hold two meetings within the Western Isles.</p> <p>Action – Invitations to the consultation meetings would be sent out to relevant stakeholders.</p> |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| 5 | Caledonian MacBrayne Operational and Performance Update | <p>Robert Morrison gave a presentation providing an update on operations and performance. A service overview on all routes was provided in the Presentation. It was indicated that there would be two phases of improvement to the current format for reporting. Phase 1 would see Timetabled Performance published to the web on a daily basis and Phase 2, in respect of contractual performance, the production of Community Specific Packs to be trialled firstly with Arran –Islay and then the Uig-Tarbert-Lochmaddy routes with a hope to roll out across the network if it proved to be successful.</p> <p>Members were afforded the opportunity to ask questions of Mr Morrison.</p> <p>Ms Gail Robertson (OHCG) requested separate figures in respect of the Uig–Tarbert-Lochmaddy route. Action - Robert Morrison to provide.</p> <p>Mr Uisdean Robertson mentioned that when passengers were required to use the lift on the Sound of Harris vessel it required two members of the crew to oversee. This could cause delays particularly when there is a high volume of elderly/infirm passengers. Action – Robert Morrison would monitor the situation and record statistics for analysis.</p> <p>Ian Fordham requested details of historic tidal restricted sailings to compare with current figures. Action – Robert Morrison would provide a comparison.</p> <p>Ms Gail Robertson highlighted that the Uig-Lochmaddy route was already seeing delays due to the volume of traffic and the short time allowed for the turn-around of the sailings. Action - Robert Morrison would closely monitor the situation.</p> |
| 6 | Ferry Availability Study Update | <p>Mr Neil Macrae Partnership Manager submitted a Report providing an update on the Draft Ferry Availability Review. A Draft Summary of the work undertaken by Outer Hebrides Tourism for the period April – October 2016 for sailings serving the islands of Lewis, Harris, North Uist, South Uist, Barra, Mull, Coll, Tiree, Islay and Skye was detailed in the Report. The results showed that all routes studied had experienced significant levels of sailings becoming unavailable to book online (UTOB) with the majority of those monitored showing a minimum of 30% UTOB sailings over the period.</p> <p>It was stated in the Report that it was proposed to not carry out a similar study during 2017 as there had been the adoption of a strategic approach to future network planning of ferry services and supporting infrastructure for the Clyde and Hebrides Ferry service (CHFS) contract together with commitments from CalMac to improve ticketing and booking systems.</p> <p>Donald Macarthur provided an update at the meeting on the statistical information.</p> <p>Ian Fordham expressed a desire to meet with CalMac to discuss a more efficient way to collect the data required.</p> <p>Brian Fulton thanked Donald and everyone that had been involved in the large task of pulling together all the information for the ferry</p> |

| | | |
|---|--|---|
| | | <p>availability study.</p> <p>Action – The update was noted.</p> |
| 7 | CalMac Summer 2018 Timetable Proposals | <p>Demi Wylie gave a presentation on the CalMac CHFS2 Timetable Process. The Presentation intimated that the deadline for the timetables to be published and open for bookings was 30 April for the winter timetable and 31 October for the summer timetable. An overview of the summer 2018 consultation was provided together with a breakdown of the processes to be followed.</p> <p>Members were afforded the opportunity to ask questions of Ms Wylie.</p> <p>Action – Iain Mackinnon agreed to forward the current consultation on this occasion but suggested that stakeholders be contacted directly for future consultation.</p> |
| 8 | Vessel Replacement Deployment Plan | <p>Richard Hadfield gave a presentation on the Vessel Replacement and Deployment Plan (VRDP) (2015 and 2016). The 2015 Annual Report had been published in December 2016 and work on the 2016 Annual Report was underway and would be shared, along with 2015 data, once it had been finalised in a sharable format.</p> <p>The VRDP 2014 implementation had resulted in two major vessels being constructed and shoreside infrastructure requirements being assessed and addressed at Brodick-Ardrossan and Uig, Tarbert and Lochmaddy.</p> <p>Conclusions from the VRDP 2015 included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Peak season capacity pressure on Ardrossan- Brodick and Uig- Tarbert-Lochmaddy would be partly mitigated by the delivery of new vessels; • Cascade effects would enable additional capacity elsewhere; and • four priorities for further assessment work had been identified. <p>Members were afforded the opportunity to ask questions of Mr Hadfield.</p> <p>Action – The update was noted.</p> |
| 9 | Integrated / Public Transport Update | <p>Dave Smart provided an update on Integrated/Public Transport. In relation to the Ullapool-Inverness link it was proposed to continue on the same basis as last year running an unplanned duplicate coach if bookings were full 48 hours in advance of departure. There was a need to continue raising public awareness of the requirement to book at least 48 hours in advance.</p> <p>Robert Morrison said that CalMac would continue to work with Citylink on this issue and it was suggested that an information note could be added onto the website booking form to highlight the need to book in advance.</p> <p>Ian Fordham raised the issue with the Glasgow-Oban Scotrail link bicycle capacity and the effect it was having on the growing number of cyclists that wanted to enjoy cycling in the Highlands</p> |

| | | |
|--|--|---|
| | | <p>and Islands.</p> <p>Uisdean Robertson highlighted that there had been little progress on the Uig-Inverness link</p> <p>Action – David Smart would look into the transport links at Uig.</p> |
|--|--|---|

| | | |
|----|--------------------------------------|---|
| 10 | CMAL New Ferry Update/Harbour Update | <p>Kevin Hobbs provided a verbal update. There were currently two vessels being built. The first vessel was due to be launched on 24 August 2017 and would cover the Arran run. The second vessel was proposed to be launched in November 2017 and would cover the Uig-Lochmaddy-Tarbert run. It was hoped that the vessels would be on the network for the winter 2018/19 or possibly the summer 2019 timetables. Both vessels would be dual fuel.</p> <p>It was noted that there had been issues with lack of seating for passengers on the Loch Seaforth. CalMac were hoping to rectify this issue by monitoring and correcting passenger behaviour.</p> <p>Action – The update was noted.</p> |
| 11 | Ferry User Group Terms of Reference | <p>Mr Ranald Robertson, Partnership Director submitted a Report which set out the proposed terms of reference and structures for Ferry Service Stakeholders Engagement processes as they related to the Clyde and Hebrides Ferry Service Contract that had commenced on 1 October 2016. The consultation arrangements detailed in the Report were designed to eliminate overlaps and ensure that each layer had a distinct role and focus. The consultation tiers were summarised in the Report as follows:</p> <p>Operational – Ferry Committee (CHFS operator Led) Tactical – Regional Ferry User Groups (RTP Administered)</p> <p>Comments and feedback were invited by 28 May 2017</p> <p>Iain Mackinnon highlighted that it would be necessary to identify and consult on the options associated with the establishment of “Ferry Committees” in the Western Isles. A number of existing forums existed, eg Barra Transport Group, Association of Community Councils and Harris Transport Forum, and it was considered likely that the utilisation of these, rather than creating further groups or forums, would be preferable. There was no such existing group/forum for Lewis and views on the available options would be sought in due course.</p> <p>Action – Iain Mackinnon would request that HITRANS circulate the consultation/discussion paper for consultation.</p> |
| 12 | Dates of future Meetings | <p>It was agreed to defer this item but next series of meetings likely to be in November 2017.</p> |
| 13 | AOCB | <p>Kevin Hobbs provided an update on matters associated with the recategorisation of several routes in the CHFS network by the MCA where existing vessels had “grandfather rights” (Sound of Harris, Sound of Barra and Iona-Fionnport). There were currently four vessels with “grandfather rights” and CMAL was currently working with the MCA in this regard.</p> |