



CLYDE, KINTYRE, AND ISLANDS FERRY STAKEHOLDER GROUP
(Arran, Bute, Campbeltown, Cumbrae, Colonsay, Islay, Jura, Gigha and Cowal)

Minute of Meeting held virtually through Microsoft Teams on **Friday 6th December 2024 at 10:00**

IN ATTENDANCE	
	ARGYLL AND BUTE COUNCIL Cllr. John Armour (Chair) Mr Scott Reid
	NORTH AYRSHIRE COUNCIL Cllr Alan Hill Cllr Paul Cassidy
	INVERCLYDE COUNCIL Cllr Sandra Reynolds
	TRANSPORT SCOTLAND Ms Alison Wills Mr Brian Gordon Mr William Millar Mr Ewan Swaffield Mr Mark Hoskins Mr Paul Linhart-MacAskill
	CALEDONIAN MACBRAYNE LTD (CALMAC) Mr Finlay Macrae Ms Donna Lockhart Ms Elaine Crossan Mr David Hamill Mr Terry Williams Dr Murray Doyle
	CALEDONIAN MARITIME ASSETS LTD. (CMAL) Mr Chris Fisher
	HITRANS Mr Ranald Robertson Mr Neil MacRae
	SPT Mr Allan Comrie
	SCOTTISH CITYLINK Ker Corbett

	<p>DUNOON COMMUNITY COUNCIL Mr David Clough</p> <p>COWAL TRANSPORT FORUM Ms Kirstie Reid</p> <p>KILCREGGAN COMMUNITY COUNCIL Rev. Christine Murdoch Mr John Auld</p> <p>VISIT SCOTLAND Lynsey Eckford</p> <p>WESTERN FERRIES Mr Gordon Ross</p> <p>HAULAGE Jim Martin</p> <p>Kristian Beauman</p>
APOLOGIES	<p>Jane MacLeod, Business Representative</p> <p>Angus Campbell, Chair, FCB</p> <p>Angus Campbell, Cumbrae Ferry Committee / FCB</p> <p>David Herriot, FCB</p> <p>Lucy Sumsion, NFU Scotland</p> <p>Tim James, Tarbert and Skipness Community Council</p> <p>Des Bradley, ScotRail</p> <p>Ewen Macdonald, Campbeltown Ferry Committee</p> <p>Mr Islay MacEachern</p> <p>Mr Jim Porteous</p> <p>Mr Bill Calderwood</p> <p>John Bannatyne, Gigha Community Council</p>

1	Minute of Meeting held on 13th January 2023	The Minute of Meeting on 6 th June 2024 was approved as an accurate reflection of the meeting.
2	Matters Arising – Action Tracker	<p>Neil MacRae, HITRANS drew members attention to the action tracker that was circulated in the meeting pack which updated on actions from the previous meeting.</p> <p>Mr MacRae noted that an Action had been agreed at the other FSG meetings for the Groups to write to the Cabinet Secretary to express disappointment at the lack of input afforded to local communities and key stakeholders represented on these Groups into supporting and shaping CHFS3.</p>

		Action – It was agreed that this FSG supported the action to write to the Cabinet Secretary on CHFS 3.
3	Caledonian MacBrayne Operational and Performance Presentation (CFL)	<p>With reference to item 3 of the Minute of Meeting of 5 June 2024, CalMac, submitted an operational report which addressed the following:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Marketing 2. Improving Every Journey / Customer Insight and Experience 3. Route Performance 4. Block Booking Terms and Conditions 5. Enhanced Engagement Programme / area Management Structure 6. Vessel Deployments Winter 2024-25 / New Vessels and Cascade Effect 7. Ar Turas / eBooking Update <p>Members noted the Calmac Ferries update and thanked Mr MacRae.</p>
4	Western Ferries Operational and Commercial Update	<p>Gordon Ross introduced the Western Ferries Report which was circulated in the meeting papers. The report covered:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • During the period 1st April to 31st October 2024, Western Ferries provided 19,329 sailings which included an additional 359 sailings during peak times. Over that period, 42 sailings were cancelled for weather related disruptions, 9 cancellations were attributable to technical issues and for other reasons. As such, a service reliability of 99.7%. Western Ferries considers this level of reliability to be satisfactory. • Car and passenger carrying figures for the period in comparison to the previous year are marginally behind, respectively 2.0% and 1.3%. <p>Members noted the Western Ferries update and thanked Mr Ross.</p>
5	CMAL Update	<p>With reference to item 5 of the Minute of Meeting of 6 June 2024 Blair Moglia of CMAL submitted a report updating members regarding the overall activities and projects underway for both Vessels and Port Infrastructure. The following items were highlighted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Vessels – including handover of MV Glen Sannox • Port Infrastructure • General update <p>Mr Gordon Ross asked for an update on vessel replacement plans for Gourock – Dunoon.</p> <p>Mr Paul Linhart-Macaskill updated on the Gourock – Dunoon vessel and infrastructure project with a report being prepared for Ministerial consideration on the future provision of services on this route.</p> <p>Members thanked Mr Fisher for the update.</p>

6	Argyll and Bute Council Update	<p>With reference to item 10 of the Minute of Meeting of 6 June 2024 Scott Reid provided a late report in advance of the meeting and spoke to this at the meeting. The report covered the following items relevant to the Group area:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Port Askaig • Campbeltown • Rothesay Quay • Feolin • Gigha and Tayinloan <p>David Clough and Kirstie Reid raised a concern that the Rothesay works had impacted on the Dunoon – Gourock service with a number of cancellations resultant from the work.</p> <p>Scott Reid recognised these concerns and advised that CFL worked to minimise disruption to other routes as part of the partnership work on ensuring the essential works could progress at Rothesay.</p> <p>Gordon Ross asked if there was any update on the works to remove the Dunoon linkspan.</p> <p>Scott Reid noted there was nothing new to update on this. The expectation is that works will be in line with what has previously been shared.</p> <p>Members thanked Mr Reid for the update.</p>
7	Transport Scotland Updates	<p>With reference to item 6 of the Minute of Meeting of 6 June, Paul Linhart-MacAskill, Ewan Swaffield and Mark Hoskins on behalf of Transport Scotland (TS) submitted a report updating members on the following Initiatives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Island Connectivity Plan <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Consultation Responses - Community Needs Assessments including the recent work on Dunoon / Kilcreggan - Gourock. • Ferry Fares Policy • Onward and Connecting Travel • Low Carbon • Investment in New Vessels • Ardrossan <p>Cllr Hill underlined the urgency of a decision being made to progress the Ardrossan improvement works. The delay has been causing real concern and frustration.</p> <p>Paul Linhart-MacAskill recognised the concerns expressed and the importance of the Ardrossan development noting that the sums involved are significant and this means a number of processes need to be worked through in terms of business case review. In the meantime</p>

	<p>progress has been made in bringing MV Glen Sannox into the fleet and Troon has been readied for this.</p> <p>Gordon Ross asked for an update on the feedback received by Transport Scotland on the Community Needs Assessment of Dunoon – Gourock.</p> <p>Paul Linhart – MacAskill responded to say he did not have the detail on this but suggested that Transport Scotland would be considering opportunities to provide a summary of the work that could be shared with stakeholders.</p> <p>David Clough noted that Dunoon Community Council has written to Transport Scotland expressing the very significant concerns of the Community Council on the CNA process. Critical areas not considered adequately include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cowal Peninsula SIMD status • Timetables based on 1 December 2022 • Reliability is the biggest single impact on passenger numbers. In 2021 4680 sailings were cancelled on the passenger service. • No reference to route as a lifeline service. • Inconsistency with previous reports. <p>Ewan Swaffield responded to note that Transport Scotland have prepared a detailed response on each of the points raised which will be sent on Monday 9th December. On the points Mr Swaffield explained that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ministerial advice will include any updated figures available. It is recognised that reliability is the key factor that needs to be improved. • SIMD information will be considered in the evident to Ministers. • Information feedback to the online survey and from the consultation events will also be used to inform Ministers. <p>Mr Clough responded to note that despite the CAN report having been prepared over a year ago it appears to have been left in limbo and now there appears to be urgency to progress a decision despite the flaws in the report.</p> <p>Mr Swaffield explained that the report is not the sole source of evidence being submitted to Ministers. It is a part of the reporting but is augmented by other sources not least the community feedback.</p> <p>Mr Gordon Ross noted that carrying figures have been updated for sharing with Ministers and asked if the financial figures in terms of operating cost have been shared with Ministers and if so can these be shared with this Group.</p>
--	---

		<p>Mr Linhart-MacAskill advised that the latest financial information in terms of route costs will be included in the Ministerial briefing and that an opinion can be sought from colleagues on whether the information can be shared with the FSG.</p> <p>Action – Transport Scotland have been asked to share costs with the FSG on the deficit funding required to support the Gourock to Dunoon and Gourock to Kilcreggan ferry services.</p> <p>Mr Hoskins also provided a verbal update on CHFS3. This included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Detail on the level of Consultation Responses received following the public engagement exercise. • CHFS 2 Extension and Improvements Required Through the Extension Period • Teckal Governance Work moving forward with the Operator • Competition Markets Authority Subsidy Control • Trade Union Meeting on 30 October • All In Person Stakeholder Event Proposed Early in the New Year <p>Members thanked Mr Linhart-MacAskill, Mr Swaffield and Mr Hoskins for the update.</p>
8.	Communities Update Board	<p>With reference to item 9 of the Minute of Meeting of 6 June, Angus Campbell provided a report on the activities of the Ferries Community Board since the last FSG meeting. No representative of the FCB was available to attend the meeting as the date clashed with an FCB Board meeting.</p> <p>The Chair expressed his disappointment at the clash of the FCB meeting date with this Group which meant some very valuable contributions were lost to this meeting. The Chair asked the Secretariat to contact Mr Campbell to ask that meeting dates for 2025 are coordinated to avoid a similar clash occurring in the future.</p> <p>It was agreed to note the Ferries Community Board update.</p>
9.	Confirm Pre-agreed Date of Next Meeting	<p>It was agreed that the next meeting of the Clyde, Kintyre and Islands Ferry Stakeholder Group would take place on a hybrid basis with an in person option at an appropriate location supported with a virtual option to join through MS Teams. The agreed date being Friday 6 June 2025 at 1100.</p>